Charlotte Historic District Commission Application

Staff Review

HDC 2018-464

Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness

Date: September 12, 2018

PID# 12108108

LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: Dilworth

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 922 East Boulevard

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: Addition/Porch enclosure

APPLICANT/OWNER: Todd Carter/East Boulevard Partners LLC

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Conditions

The existing structure is a 1.5 story Colonial Revival cottage constructed in 1920. Architectural features include side roof with two gabled dormers and a recessed corner porch. Siding material is wood with cornerboards. The building is currently occupied by a commercial use. Adjacent structures are a mixture of 1-2 story former residential houses that are now used for commercial purposes and commercial-type buildings. The lot size is approximately 67' x 190'.

Proposal

The proposal is enclosing the recessed corner porch on the front elevation. The existing porch stairs, piers/columns, and handrail are to remain. The new enclosure is reversible. Materials include wood lap siding and wood cornerboards to match existing. New windows will be wood or aluminum clad to match existing. New roof and trim details will match existing. There are no impacts to mature trees.

<u>Design Guidelines – Porches, page 4.8</u>

- 1. Retain porches that are critical to defining the design and integrity of the historic district. Keep porches open to provide shade and reduce heat gain during warm weather.
- 2. Repair and replace only damaged elements of porches by matching the materials, methods of construction, and details of the existing original fabric. Avoid stripping porches and steps of original materials and architectural features such as handrails, balusters, columns, and flooring.
- 3. Reconstruct missing elements based on physical or photographic detail including all details and materials.
- 4. Do not enclose porches on a primary elevation or alter a front porch that reorients the entrance away from the street elevation.
- 5. Enclosure of side porches and balconies is discouraged. If enclosure of a side porch or balcony is required for a new use, the enclosure should be designed to ensure that the historic character and features of the porch are preserved.
- 6. Any porch enclosure that is permitted should be designed to be reversible and removal of original features should be minimal.
- 7. Original or historic porch railing designs may need to be adapted to meet the building code. The use of booster rails may be an appropriate solution to make the original balustrade code-compliant.

Design Guidelines – Additions, page 7.2

- 1. Attempt to locate the addition on the rear elevation so that it is minimally visible from the street.
- 2. Limit the size of the addition so that it does not visually overpower the existing building.

- 3. Attempt to attach new additions or alterations to existing buildings in such a manner that, if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired.
- 4. Maintain the original orientation of the structure. If the primary entrance is located on the street façade, it should remain in that location.
- 5. Maintain the existing roof pitch. Roof lines for new additions should be secondary to those of the existing structure. The original roof as visible from the public right-of-way should not be raised.
- 6. Make sure that the design of a new addition is compatible with the existing building. The new work should be differentiated from the old while being compatible with its massing, form, scale, directional expression, roof forms and materials, foundation, fenestration, and materials.

All New Construction	n Projects Will be Evaluated for Compatibility by the Following Criteria	Page #
Setback	in relationship to setback of immediate surroundings	6.2
Spacing	the side distance from adjacent buildings as it relates to other buildings	6.3
Orientation	the direction of the front of the building as it relates to other buildings in the district	6.4
Massing	the relationship of the buildings various parts to each other	6.5
Height and Width	the relationship to height and width of buildings in the project surroundings	6.6
Scale	the relationship of the building to those around it and the human form	6.7
Directional Expression	the vertical or horizontal proportions of the building as it relates to other buildings	6.8
Foundations	the height of foundations as it relates to other buildings in project surroundings	6.9
Roof Form and Materials	as it relates to other buildings in project surroundings	6.10
Cornices and Trim	as it relates to the stylistic expression of the proposed building	6.11
Doors and Windows	the placement, style and materials of these components	6.12
Porches	as it relates to the stylistic expression of the proposed building and other buildings in the district.	6.14
Materials	proper historic materials or approved substitutes	6.15
Size	the relationship of the project to its site	6.2 & 3
Rhythm	the relationship of windows, doors, recesses and projections	6.12
Context	the overall relationship of the project to its surroundings.	6.1-16
Landscaping	a tool to soften and blend the project with the district	8.1-11

All projects should use this summary checklist to ensure a submittal addresses all the new construction criteria.

Staff Recommendation

- 1. The proposal is not incongruous with the District and meets the guidelines for Rehabilitation of Building Elements Porches, 4.8 and for Additions, 7.2 above.
- 2. Minor revisions may be reviewed by staff.

Charlotte Historic District Commission Case 2018-464 HISTORIC DISTRICT: DILWORTH ADDITION





