

**Charlotte Historic District Commission**  
**Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness**

**October 12, 2011**

---

<b>ADDRESS OF PROPERTY</b>	725 Woodruff Place, Wesley Heights Local Historic District	HDC 2011-083
<b>SUMMARY OF REQUEST</b>	Second Floor Addition	
<b>OWNERS</b>	Bernice & Odis Carmon	
<b>APPLICANT</b>	Nancy Montague	

---

**Details of Proposed Request**

This application seeks approval for the use of Hardiplank Artisan siding on a previously approved addition.

**Current Status and Context of Property**

This house was constructed in 1948, according to Mecklenburg County Tax Records. It is simple one story wood frame with gabled ends and a small entrance stoop. It is similar in style and scale to many houses in the immediate area, although this section of Woodruff Place does contain a variety of sizes and styles of homes. The house is listed as a contributing structure to the Wesley Heights National Register Historic District.

**Relevant HDC Design Guidelines**

- *Building Materials*

**Relevant Secretary of Interior's Standards for Historic Rehabilitation**

(As cited in the Charlotte Zoning Ordinance Section 10.210)

- (i) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- (j) New additions and adjacent or new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**Outstanding Issues**

The addition proposed for this house received a conceptual approval from the HDC in August, 2011. Subsequently, the architect and homeowner have met with Staff to review the final details, which has resulted in a simpler and more appropriate design.

At that meeting, the homeowner has requested that the HDC consider the approval of *Artisan HardiPlank* siding for this addition.

Current HDC policy on *Building Materials* states in part:

***Non-Traditional Building Materials***

1. The Historic District Commission considers substitute siding to be inappropriate for use in a designated Local Historic District, and does not allow its use on an historic structure within a Local Historic District.
2. The use of the following substitute siding materials is considered incongruous with the overall character of local historic districts, and is prohibited.
  - Vinyl
  - Aluminum or other metal sidings
  - Masonite
3. Cementitious board products are rarely considered appropriate for the main structure on a property. The Historic District Commission will consider these products on a case by case basis.
4. All proposals for the use of other non-traditional building materials for projects in Local Historic Districts will be judged on a case-by-case basis by the full Historic District Commission. The Commission will determine how well the proposed material and its proposed use are contextually appropriate in design, texture and other visual qualities.
5. The use of substitute or replacement building materials will not be considered as an alternative to routine maintenance.

The final exterior elevations for this addition will be available at the October 12<sup>th</sup> HDC meeting. The Commission will need to make a determination if the proposed siding material adheres to the above policy, and if not, if an exception to the policy is warranted by the circumstances of this proposal.



# Charlotte Historic District Commission - Case 2011-083

