

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

June 13, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Roger Dahnert
Mr. Don Duffy
Mr. Tom Egan
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair
Ms. I-Mei Ervin
Ms. Debra Glennon, 2nd Vice Chair
Ms. Barbara Highfill
Mr. Bradley Norvell
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair
Ms. Karen Rush

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Steven Firestone
Mr. Curtis Watkins

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Steven Firestone

Mr. Curtis Watkins

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the

Historic District Commission

Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present Chairman George called the regular June meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:16 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of

those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses:	417/419 East Kingston Avenue	Dilworth
	1309 Lexington Avenue	Dilworth
	315 West 9 th Street	Fourth Ward
	814 East Boulevard	Dilworth
	612 East Worthington Avenue	Dilworth
	1423 Lexington Avenue	Dilworth
	524 East Worthington Avenue	Dilworth

Application: 417/419 East Kingston Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1910 has been converted to duplex use but is being renovated back to single family. A cross gable addition will be constructed beyond existing cross gables. Materials and details will match house. The existing double front doors will be removed and replaced with a single door and sidelights. Porch roof will be changed to copper. Where the front porch wraps to a door on the left, a window will replace the door. A drive and gate will be added. Three 15” caliper walnut trees will have to be removed for the driveway installation.

Applicant Comments: Owner Karen Barton said they looked at keeping the three walnut trees but the trees are growing under the canopy of a great oak in the

adjacent yard and leaning. An arborist will lay out the tree protection parameters.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions, Tree Removal, Landscaping***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the application with conditions: Revised plans will be submitted to Staff which show (1) lowered flat roof by 8-12" to be below ridge, (2) new carriage track drive to stop at new gate and continue on as a full concrete drive past the gate into the back yard, (3) tree protection of the great oak by a Certified Arborist that will be in place from the very beginning and never broached. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NOVELL, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION, DRIVE, TREE REMOVAL APPROVED – SEE MOTION.

Mr. Duffy declared a conflict of interest for the next application and removed himself from the Commission.

Application: 1309 Lexington Avenue – Addition.

The proposal is to add a small gable over the front steps to create new entry. Ten inch square columns will support the new entry element with matching pilasters. There will be wood siding in the gable. Decorative shutters will be removed and replaced with operable shutters. Due to space, they will be bi fold.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions, Shutters***, Ms. Rush made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED.

Ms. Ervin announced that she lives near the next application address. No conflict of interest was expressed.

Application: 315 West 9th Street – Addition.

This c. 1903 house has a large cross gable rear addition that may have been added in the 1970s. Also the front porch was reworked at the same time. The proposal includes: (1) remove aluminum siding, (2) remove aluminum windows, (3) remove 1970 front porch, (4) rework the rear addition, (5) replace windows.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study and for additional documentation, Ms. Highfill made a MOTION to DEFER and offer the opportunity for a Design Review. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DESIGN REVIEW WILL REVIEW AND OFFER SUGGESTIONS ON JUNE 20. THE COMMITTEE (DUFFY, ERVIN, NORVELL) WILL MEET WITH APPLICANTS, STAFF.

Ms. Glennon announced that the following applicant is her veterinarian. No conflict of interest was expressed.

Application: 814 East Boulevard – Addition.

This large symmetrical house has been a veterinary office for several years. During its last renovation the front porch was glassed in as the operating room. There is a metal fire stair on the left side. The proposal is to remove the fire stair and reinstall it on the rear. A two story 8 and 1/2' wide addition will be added to the side. It will be notched in on the 2nd floor with an shed roof. All roof slopes and materials will match existing house.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the application. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED. NOTE: SIDE ELEVATION WILL BE REVISED BY ADDING MORE WINDOWS.

Application: 612 East Worthington Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1915 house is located across from the parking lot for the Greek Church. It is a two story house with a front to back gable. A former rear addition will be removed and replaced with a new addition. A boxed bay on the left will be replaced. A new rear sunroom with windows above panels, and a sleeping porch above is the proposed addition. Details and materials will match existing.

Applicant Comments: Designer Angie Lauer said the proposed transom windows on the side will be removed.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the application with revised plans which show removal of transom windows on the side. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED WITH ONE CHANGE.

Application: 1423 Lexington Avenue – Addition.

A previous enclosed porch addition is to be removed from the c. 1941 house. The small flat roofed porch enclosure will be replaced with a glassed in room with a side facing gabled roof. The new space will be a sunroom with a closet above it. There will be a circular window in the gable end giving some natural light to the new closet.

Mr. Ristaino left at 4:45 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

Applicant Comments: Architect John Phares said the side window pattern has been adjusted to be five windows centered on the gable. The circular window is a modern touch.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Ms. Rush made a MOTION to APPROVE the application. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED.

Application: 524 East Worthington Avenue – Addition.

A rear addition is proposed for this c. 1911 house. The rear addition is going straight back with a new cross gable. Materials and details will match existing.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Ms. Highfill made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: REAR ADDITION APPROVED.

- Report from the Nominating Committee: Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to keep the same officers – Ms. George, Chair; Mr. Ristaino, Vice Chair; Ms. Glennon Second Vice Chair. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE,
GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NORVELL, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: OFFICERS REMAIN THE SAME.

- Mr. Rogers shared the sympathy of staff to Mr. Duffy whose father recently passed away.

May Minutes were unanimously approved with the usual direction from Ms. George to report any changes or corrections to Mrs. Birmingham.

With business completed the meeting adjourned at 5:46: pm. The meeting length was 2 hours and 30 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission