LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT:  Wilmore

PROPERTY ADDRESS:  224, 228, 232, and 236 West Kingston Avenue

SUMMARY OF REQUEST:  New Construction

APPLICANT/OWNER:  Bobby Drakeford

The application was denied March 13, 2019 for the following: height, width, scale, massing and roof forms, incongruous with the character of the district in its neighborhood context and its gateway location. The HDC has not evaluated the other guidelines.

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Conditions
The four properties are one story structures that were re-used for a day care; existing zoning is R-22 Multi-Family. The buildings are connected with heated space. 236 West Kingston Ave. was constructed in 1923 and connected to 232, 228 and 224 were also connected to make one building. They were constructed in 1936 and 1940 respectively. A 365-Day Stay of Demolition was approved by the HDC September 13, 2017. Adjacent structures are commercial and single family (one story) on the block. Across the street are single and multi-family buildings. The historic multi-family building at 241 West Kingston Avenue was constructed in 1949, the height is approximately 32’ measured from grade. Its adjacent single-family house (245 West Kingston Avenue) was constructed in 1954, approximate height is 33’. The single-family house at 251 West Kingston Avenue was constructed in 1936 with a pre-Historic District rear addition height of approximately 40’.

Proposal
The proposal is new construction of townhouses. Existing zoning R-22MF allows for the construction of townhome units. The project is in the rezoning process to a more urban residential district, UR-2. Front setback of Building A is 64’-4” from back of curb to front thermal wall. Front setback of Building B is 63’-4” from back of curb to front thermal wall. Front setback of Building C is 61’-1” from back of curb to front thermal wall. Site features include a 5’ side yard and brick pillar/wood fence along the single-family side, and either a 15-foot landscaped buffer or 11.25’ buffer with wood fence behind the alley easement in the rear yard. Existing and proposed trees are noted on the site plan.

Policy & Design Guidelines for New Construction, page 6.1
Charlotte’s historic districts’ distinctive character is derived not only from architectural style but also from the nature of the street created by building setback, spacing, mass and height as well as the landscape quality. This street character and the surrounding properties are considered to be the context for any new building. As such, the block in which the new site is located should be carefully studied when designing a new infill dwelling. This context should include both sides of the subject street.

The Charlotte Historic District Commission will not specify a particular architectural style or design for new construction projects. The scale, mass and size of a building are often far more important than the decorative details applied. However, well designed stylistic and decorative elements, as well as building materials and landscaping, can give new construction projects the attributes necessary to blend in with the district, while creating a distinctive character for the building.
The criteria in this section are all important when considering whether a proposed new building design is appropriate and compatible. All criteria should be taken into consideration in the design process with the goal to ensure that the new design respects its historic neighboring buildings.

### All New Construction Projects Will be Evaluated for Compatibility by the Following Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Page #</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Setback</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spacing</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massing</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Height and Width</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directional Expression</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roof Form and Materials</td>
<td>6.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornices and Trim</td>
<td>6.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doors and Windows</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porches</td>
<td>6.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>6.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size</td>
<td>6.2 &amp; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>6.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landscaping</td>
<td>8.1-11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All projects should use this summary checklist to ensure a submittal addresses all the new construction criteria.

### Staff Recommendation

Staff has the following concerns with the proposal:

1. The scale/height relationship between the historic single-family houses at 244 and 240 W. Kingston and Building A.
2. Contextual criteria of massing (particularly on Buildings A, C, D and E), stoops/porches (particularly on Buildings D + E), height, roof form, rhythm.
HDC-2019-00217

PID: 11908907; 11908906; 11908905; 11908904

LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: WILMORE

PROPOSED PROJECT: NEW CONSTRUCTION

May Meeting 2019
EXISTING SITE CONDITIONS | 224 W. KINGSTON AVE.

224-236 W. KINGSTON AVE. | 05.08.2019
EXISTING SITE CONDITIONS | 232 W. KINGSTON AVE.
EXISTING SITE CONDITIONS | 236 W. KINGSTON AVE.

224-236 W. KINGSTON AVE. | 05.08.2019
“Zoning along the edges of some areas of the historic districts allows larger, multi-family or commercial buildings. To minimize their impacts on neighboring historic dwellings the HDC shall enforce the design guidelines through scale reducing techniques.

Scale-reducing techniques such as dividing the elevation elements into smaller bays, varying building planes, breaking up roof masses, using multiple materials, and taking clues from nearby historic buildings are essential to reducing the negative impacts of these larger structures”

- HDC Guidelines, pg. 6.1
This map or report is prepared for the inventory of real property within Mecklenburg County and is compiled from recorded deeds, plats, tax maps, surveys, planimetric maps, and other public records and data. Users of this map or report are hereby notified that the aforementioned public primary information sources should be consulted for verification. Mecklenburg County and its mapping contractors assume no legal responsibility for the information contained herein.
Front Setback
- Proposed: 59'-0" to 69'-5"
- Existing: 59'-9" - 55'-7"
- Steps back into neighborhood
- Porch depth: 6'-0"

Rear Yard
- Proposed: 15'-0"

Side Yard
- Proposed: 5'-0"
SPACING
PLANTINGS (PROPOSED)

Existing trees to remain:
- 22" Oak
- 13" Maple
- 26" Oak
- 14" Poplar (street tree)
- 18" Poplar (street tree)
- 20" Hardwood

Plants to be Planted:
- (2) 2"-2.5" cal., 12'-14' street trees
- (14) trees
- (10) screening shrubs
- (16) Leyland Cypress (potentially on rear properties)
BUILDINGS A, B, & C WEST KINGSTON ELEVATION

BUILDINGS A, B, & C REAR ELEVATION

BUILDING A SIDE ELEVATION

BUILDING B SIDE ELEVATION

BUILDING C SIDE ELEVATION

NOTE: COLORS ARE SHOWN FOR ILLUSTRATIVE PURPOSES ONLY AND ARE SUBJECT TO CHANGE
ORIENTATION

FRONT BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

BACK BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION
MASSING & COMPLEXITY OF FORM

FRONT BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

AXONOMETRIC

MASSING & COMPLEXITY OF FORM
224-236 W. KINGSTON AVE. | 05.08.2019
HEIGHT & WIDTH
HEIGHT & WIDTH
Scale Reduction Strategies:

- Lower roof eave
- Window details
- Porches (at varying heights)
- Variation in roof line
- Variation in material
- Variation in texture
- Fenestration
- Variety of building
DIRECTIONAL EXPRESSION

- Square
- Horizontal
- Color variation to make expression of larger buildings more square

FRONT BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

BACK BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION
FOUNDATIONS

FRONT BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

BACK BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

235 W. Kingston

241 W. Kingston

245 W. Kingston

240 W. Kingston
ROOF FORM & MATERIALS:
- Front gable
- Hip
- Lower eave covering porch
- Full story dormer
- Architectural shingles at roof
CORNICES & TRIM

- Similar to nearby existing materials and profiles
- Craftsman features such as brackets and tapered columns
- Flat trim profiles to mimic features of nearby structures

2 story porch detail similar to 241 W. Kingston

Layers of trim in eaves similar to 235 W. Kingston and other bungalow style homes throughout neighborhood

Gable detail similar to 245 W. Kinston

Enlarged porch detail
• Similar size/composition of nearby structures
• Ratio of solid/void and rhythm similar to neighboring homes
• 3 over 1 double sash windows with interior/exterior fixed muntins
• Detailing varies for brick field vs. siding field
MATERIALS

- Brick (Modular)
- Horizontal Siding (Hardie Artisan or Nichiha)
- Shake Siding (Hardie or Nichiha)
- Trim (Hardie Artisan)
- Architectural Shingle Roofs

235 W. Kingston

241 W. Kingston

245 W. Kingston

240 W. Kingston

FRONT BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION

BACK BUILDINGS - W. KINGSTON ELEVATION