LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: Wilmore

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1711 Merriman Avenue

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: Alternative Materials

APPLICANT/OWNER: Justin Poovey

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Conditions
The existing structure is a one-story house constructed in 1946. The house appears to be a blend of cottage and Bungalow design. Architectural features include a front gable roof, two brick chimneys, 6/6 wood windows and a partial width front porch with a hipped roof supported by brick piers and battered columns. Existing brick piers and chimneys are not painted. The foundation is concrete block. Siding material is asbestos shingle, which is believed to be original to the house, some of which are broken, cracked, or missing. An infilled rear porch has Masonite siding. Lot dimensions are approximately 50’ x 170’. Adjacent structures are 1-2 story single family houses.

Proposal
• The proposed project is to remove the original asbestos shingle siding and replace it with fiber-cement siding. The new fiber-cement siding is similar in profile, depth, and dimension.

• The proposed project also includes the replacement of the original wood windows with new wood windows.

• A rear addition and other rehabilitation work that met the criteria for staff review has already been approved.

Design Guidelines – Building Materials, page 5.1
Charlotte’s neighborhoods have a very wide variety of materials used for foundations, siding, roofs, and details. Many historic materials have a long life if they are properly maintained. Moisture is the most frequent cause of deterioration for many materials. Guidance on replacement materials is also provided in this chapter. However, it is important to note that substitute materials are generally not allowed when rehabilitating historic buildings in Charlotte’s historic districts. Information on substitute materials for new construction can be found in this document under Guidelines for New Construction.

Design Guidelines - Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, page 2.5
1. A property shall be used for its historical purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires the replacement of a distinctive feature, the new one shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historical materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

**Design Guidelines-Trim, page 4.11**

1. Repair rather than replace existing historic trim, matching original materials, details and profiles.

2. Match deteriorated trim with new trim to match as closely as possible in material, details and profiles. Do not remove elements that are part of the original design of the structure without replacing them in-kind.

3. Replace missing trim based on physical evidence. Do not replace original trim with material that conveys a different period of construction or architectural style.

4. Avoid using substitute materials such as fiberglass, composites, and PVC type products when repairing or replacing historic wood elements.


18. Give depth and profile to windows by using true divided lights, or three-part simulated divided lights with integral spacer bars and interior and exterior fixed muntins. Small variations such as the width and depth of the muntin and sash may be permitted if those variations do not significantly impact the historic characteristics of the window design. Clip-in/false muntins, flat muntins and removable external grilles are not allowed.

19. Replace a wood window with a wood window when possible. Wood-resin composite, aluminum clad wood, or fiberglass windows that meet these guidelines may be considered on a case by-case basis. Requests for vinyl windows must be reviewed by the full Historic District Commission.
Staff Analysis
Staff has the following concerns with the proposal:

1. Existing asbestos shingle cannot be repaired and is no longer manufactured.
   a. One potential option is to replace broken shingles with intact salvaged shingles.
   b. Another option is to allow for replacement with a new material that matches the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, per Standard #6 above.

2. Will the existing wood trim (window, doors, roof, etc.) will it be repaired and re-installed or replaced?

3. Since there is no evidence that lap wood siding was ever installed on this house, the replacement of the asbestos shingle with lap wood siding would conflict with Standard #3, above.

4. The Commission will determine if the proposed replacement window and trim, where required, meet the Guidelines.
1711 Merriman Avenue, Wilmore

Built 1946

Window Replacement and Siding Repair or Replacement

_COA HDCADMRM-2019-00359_ approved replacement of gable windows (front and rear(not original)), replacement of left elevation basement windows, and restoration of other windows, parging of foundation cinderblock, roof replacement, rear deck addition with screened-in porch, and adding 3 windows matching existing on back right elevation and rear elevation.

Existing Siding

Existing siding is 12”x24”cementitious-asbestos shingle with wood trim, wood porch, and wood soffits. Rear addition (seen on right and rear elevations) has Masonite siding. Denting, breaking, and chipping of siding is prevalent. Rear and right elevation corner will require new siding after window installation.
Historic Properties with Asbestos Shingle Siding

Wilmore, Dilworth
Proposed Repair Material as “Option A” below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specifications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dimensions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coverage Area (sq. ft.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Thickness (in.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Length (in.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Width (in.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Color Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Color/Finish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finish Type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Material</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profiles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siding Features</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siding Type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siding Style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Expectancy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WeatherSide Purity 12 in. x 24 in. Cement Fiber Wavy Shingle Siding

- Fire and freeze-thaw resistant replacement for asbestos siding
- Pre-primed, ready to be painted to match existing wall color
- Shop the WeatherSide Fiber Cement Siding

$108.00 per Bundle

Save up to $100 on your qualifying purchase.
Apply for a Home Depot Consumer Card
Original siding was manufactured with 90% cement and 10% asbestos, until research discovered asbestos can cause mesothelioma.
Proposed Repair Material as “Option B” below. - 7” Exposed Wood Lap Siding
Existing Windows

Existing windows are 6/6 putty glazed single pane wood windows with 3/16” bars

Bars rotted

Bars rotted/broken off
Excessive rot and detachment
LEFT ELEVATION

Kitchen Window

Spiral rod balance system compromised
RIGHT ELEVATION
Proposed Windows

1. 6/6 putty glazed single pane wood windows with 3/16” bars
From our first days in the millwork business, VictorBilt has been providing these classic wood windows, and with the advancements in wood treating through Woodlife 1317, customers can be assured that they have a window built to last.

**HIDDEN BALANCE SYSTEM DETAILS**

- No Vinyl Balance, for All Wood Presentation
- Inverted Spring secured to sash with clip securely to jamb—all hidden during normal operation
- Double Hung Standard
- Wood Parting Stop
- Full Travel Sash
- Available as Sash Pack to fit existing frames

For more information please call us, speak with your salesperson, or visit www.victorbilt.com
864-242-6571 ofc
864-242-0433 fax
2. 6/6 wood window with 7/8” SDL and insulated glass, argon filled