LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: Dilworth

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 1719 Dilworth Road East

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: Addition, fenestration changes, garage

APPLICANT/OWNER: Chris and Victoria Borin

The project was continued for the following: 1) Re-study of the front elevation including the front porch as it relates to maintaining the existing asymmetrical roof slope and side light on the front door, 2) Garage massing needs to be re-studied to ensure it is secondary to the primary structure and that it matches the language of the existing house, 3) Re-study the massing of bay window on the right side and incorporate into that elevation more successfully.

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Conditions
The existing structure is a one story house constructed in 1950. Design features include an asymmetrical sloping front gable roof and wide picture windows.

Project
The project is a front porch addition with 10” square columns and metal roof, second floor addition that raises the ridge approximately 2’-3” to approx. 24’-1”, rear dormer, right side addition, rear first floor addition and rear porch. Fenestration changes include new Kolbe aluminum clad STDL windows throughout in the place of existing replacement GBG aluminum clad windows, a new front door and sidelight, and new patio doors. New materials and trim will match existing, siding is wood lap. The detached garage is approximately 23’ in height, cementitious lap siding is proposed with mitered corners.

Revisions – January 2017
1. The front porch has been redesigned. The roof follows the slope of the primary gable and the porch entry is arched to match the arch on the existing front doorway.
2. Side addition roof detail has been redesigned to align with the existing eave and hip roof.
3. Eave brackets have been added.
4. The garage roof form follows the front façade of the house. Side gable now extends now the garage. The applicant is requesting cementitious siding on the garage.

Design Guidelines-Trim, page 4.11
1. Repair rather than replace existing historic trim, matching original materials, details and profiles.
2. Match deteriorated trim with new trim to match as closely as possible in material, details and profiles. Do not remove elements that are part of the original design of the structure without replacing them in-kind.
3. Replace missing trim based on physical evidence. Do not replace original trim with material that conveys a different period of construction or architectural style.
4. Avoid using substitute materials such as fiberglass, composites, and PVC type products when repairing or replacing historic wood elements.

18. Give depth and profile to windows by using true divided lights, or three-part simulated divided lights with integral spacer bars and interior and exterior fixed muntins. Small variations such as the width and depth of the muntin and sash may be permitted if those variations do not significantly impact the historic characteristics of the window design. Clip-in/false muntins, flat muntins and removable external grilles are not allowed.

19. Replace a wood window with a wood window when possible. Wood-resin composite, aluminum clad wood, or fibreglass windows that meet these guidelines may be considered on a case by-case basis. Requests for vinyl windows must be reviewed by the full Historic District Commission.

Design Guidelines – Additions, page 7.2

1. Attempt to locate the addition on the rear elevation so that it is minimally visible from the street.
2. Limit the size of the addition so that it does not visually overpower the existing building.
3. Attempt to attach new additions or alterations to existing buildings in such a manner that, if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired.
4. Maintain the original orientation of the structure. If the primary entrance is located on the street façade, it should remain in that location.
5. Maintain the existing roof pitch. Roof lines for new additions should be secondary to those of the existing structure. The original roof as visible from the public right-of-way should not be raised.
6. Make sure that the design of a new addition is compatible with the existing building. The new work should be differentiated from the old while being compatible with its massing, form, scale, directional expression, roof forms and materials, foundation, fenestration, and materials.

Design Guidelines for Accessory Buildings, page 8.9

1. Retain and repair historic outbuildings. Do not demolish existing historic outbuildings.
2. Place new outbuildings, such as garages or sheds, to the rear of lots that are large enough to accommodate them, following the applicable zoning requirements. New outbuildings cannot be located in front or side yards.
3. Design new outbuildings to be compatible with the style and character of the primary historic building on the site, especially in scale, elements and roof form. Any new outbuilding must be clearly secondary to the main structure on the site.
4. Stamped metal and vinyl doors are considered to be inappropriate materials for outbuildings, and are discouraged. For more information on appropriate new construction see Chapter 6.
5. Prefabricated outbuildings that are not in keeping with the historic character of the district are not allowed where visible from the public street.
### All New Construction Projects Will be Evaluated for Compatibility by the Following Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Setback</td>
<td>In relationship to setback of immediate surroundings</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spacing</td>
<td>the side distance from adjacent buildings as it relates to other buildings</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>the direction of the front of the building as it relates to other buildings in the district</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Massing</td>
<td>the relationship of the buildings various parts to each other</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Height and Width</td>
<td>the relationship to height and width of buildings in the project surroundings</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale</td>
<td>the relationship of the building to those around it and the human form</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directional Expression</td>
<td>the vertical or horizontal proportions of the building as it relates to other buildings</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundations</td>
<td>the height of foundations as it relates to other buildings in project surroundings</td>
<td>6.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roof Form and Materials</td>
<td>as it relates to other buildings in project surroundings</td>
<td>6.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornices and Trim</td>
<td>as it relates to the stylistic expression of the proposed building</td>
<td>6.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doors and Windows</td>
<td>the placement, style and materials of these components</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porches</td>
<td>as it relates to the stylistic expression of the proposed building and other buildings in the district</td>
<td>6.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>proper historic materials or approved substitutes</td>
<td>6.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size</td>
<td>the relationship of the project to its site</td>
<td>6.2 &amp; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>the relationship of windows, doors, recesses and projections</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>the overall relationship of the project to its surroundings.</td>
<td>6.1-16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landscaping</td>
<td>a tool to soften and blend the project with the district</td>
<td>8.1-11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All projects should use this summary checklist to ensure a submittal addresses all the new construction criteria.

**Staff Analysis**

The Commission will determine if the proposed addition, fenestration changes and accessory building meet the guidelines.
Charlotte Historic District Commission Case 2017-600
HISTORIC DISTRICT: DILWORTH
ADDITION

December 6, 2017

1719 Dilworth Road E

1719 Dilworth Road E

Dilworth
Historic District
Property Lines
Building Footprints
HOC Rear Yard Calculations

Existing:
Rear Yard Total Square Footage (as measured from the back of the original house) 12,392.2 sf
Square footage of Existing Additional 773 sf
Square footage of any existing attached, etc. 103.2 sf
Square footage of any pavement (driveway, paths, etc.) 1,383.3 sf
Total existing pervious area: 1,569.4 sf
R existing pervious: 12.6%

Proposed:
Square footage of new Addition 778.9 sf
Square footage of any new outbuildings, concrete pavers, etc. 94.7 sf
Total square footage of new projects: 1,261.6 sf
R new pervious area: 13.9%

Total:
Total Pervious area post-construction: 1,890.7 sf
R pervious post-construction: 19.34%