The application was denied June 8, 2016 for its failure to meet the guidelines for Deny for Size because the proposed garage is wider than the house, for scale because the proposed garage is taller than the rear elevation of the main house, for context because it appears to be the largest garage in Plaza Midwood in the historic area at this time and because it does not read as a secondary structure to the main house. Deny the screen porch addition because it fails to meet our guidelines for massing and rhythm by punching out 3 feet on the side it becomes a featured element on the right side elevation and our guidelines would call for it to be less substantial.

The Commission will first determine if the revised proposal has been substantially redesigned and/or if there is a change of circumstance before allowing the application to be heard.

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Context
The existing structure is a single family house constructed in 1941. Adjacent structures are also single family with lots that are 192.5’ in depth. There are two accessory buildings in the rear yard that will be removed. A COA for a second floor addition was issued March 14, 2014 (2013-048).

Revised Proposal
The project is a detached garage in the rear yard and a side addition toward the rear of the house and not highly visible from the street. The following items have changed from June:

A: Detached garage
1. The garage height is has been reduced from 25’-10” to 22’-9”
2. The roof over the front entrance has been removed
3. The front dormer has been modified
4. The massing of the roof has been reduced (see south elevations)
5. Paired windows in the side elevations are single double hung
6. The rear gabled dormer has been changed to a shed dormer

B: Side addition
1. The design has not changed. The applicant has submitted past HDC approvals of side additions

Policy & Design Guidelines for Additions, page 36
Additions to existing structures in Local Historic Districts have a responsibility to complement the original structure. Additions should reflect the design, scale and architectural style of the original structure. The following guidelines are intended to encourage addition designs that are compatible with the existing structure, while not fully mimicking the original design.
2. Additions must respect the original character of the property, but must be distinguishable from the original construction.
3. All additions to the front or side of existing properties must be of a design that is sensitive to the character and massing of the existing structure.
4. Additions to the front or side of existing structures that are substantially visible from a street must go before the full Commission.

Policy & Design Guidelines – Accessory Buildings: Garages, page 50

Although the main building on a lot makes the strongest statement about a property’s contribution to the character of a Local Historic District, the accessory buildings that share the lot can also have a significant impact on the streetscape. The Historic District Commission recognizes that many of the older support buildings throughout Charlotte’s older neighborhoods are inadequate to meet the needs of today’s families and businesses.

1. New garages cannot be located in front or side yards.
2. New garages must be constructed using materials and finishes that are in keeping with the main building they serve, and that are appropriate to the district.
3. Designs for new garages must be inspired by the main building they serve. Building details should be derived from the main structure.
4. Garages must be of a proper scale for the property, and must have an appropriate site relation to the main structure on a lot and to structures on surrounding properties.
5. Garage doors that are substantially visible from any street must be of a style and materials that are appropriate to the building and the district. Stamped metal and vinyl doors are considered to be inappropriate, and are discouraged.

Staff Analysis
The Commission will determine if the proposal meets the guidelines for garages and additions.
Building Heights Sketch of
1400-1516 THE PLAZA
FACING EAST
CHARLOTTE, MECKLENBURG COUNTY, N.C.
for Charlotte—Mecklenburg Planning Department
June 06, 2016

Scale 1" = 20’
0’ 20’ 40’ 60’ 80’

Copyright 2016

General Notes:
1. The purpose of the Building Heights Sketch is to show existing building envelope heights relative to the elevation points at the public sidewalk or top of curb, front yard grade ("Grade"), tail level, and ridge line of the house depicted herein. No rearyard or sideyard measurements were made. The heights shown herein were derived from indirect measurements and are not intended for structural design.
2. The vertical datum for these elevation measurements is the North American Vertical Datum of 1988 (i.e., sea level). All other information and graphics are conceptual in nature and are not intended to represent accurate architecture or landscape features.
PRECEDENTS
CERTIFICATE NUMBER: HDC 2012-113                DATE: 29 November 2012

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1525 Thomas Avenue

HISTORIC DISTRICT: PLAZA MIDWOOD              TAX PARCEL NUMBER: 081.184.09

OWNER(S): Karen Van Sickler

DETAILS OF APPROVED PROJECT: Rear deck and screened porch. Both are wider than the existing house on one side. Cross gable screened porch will have siding to match house in gable above screening and be built over existing deck. Rear facing gable over porch will be supported by wooden columns atop stone piers to match front of house. SEE ATTACHED PLANS.

This Certificate of Appropriateness indicates that this project proposal has been determined to comply with the standards and policies of the Charlotte Historic District Commission.

No other approvals are to be inferred.

No demolition other than that specifically indicated on any attached plans is authorized under this approval.

All work must be completed in accordance with all other applicable state and local codes.

Any changes from or additions or deletions to the plans referenced herein will void this Certificate, and a new application must be filed with the Historic District Commission.

This Certificate is valid for a period of six months from the date of issuance. Failure to obtain a building permit in that time will be considered as a failure to comply with the Certificate and the Certificate will become invalid. If a building permit is not required, then the approved work must be completed within six months of the date of issuance of this Certificate. The Certificate can be renewed within twelve months of its issuance by Historic District Commission staff by written request and submission of a valid reason for failure to comply within the six-month deadline.

Mary Ellen George           Wanda Birmingham
Chairman                  Staff
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
COMPLIANCE WITH
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
11-2012
REQUERED
WS13
Proposed

HDC Review Package

1525 Thomas Avenue
Date: 09.13.2022 / Project #: 12-1AM

cluck
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

CERTIFICATE NUMBER: 2007-56-PM-08       DATE: July 19, 2007

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1428 Thomas Avenue

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Plaza Midwood       TAX PARCEL NUMBER: 08117102

OWNER: Barbara Morgan

DETAILS OF APPROVED PROJECT: Addition to Existing house, as shown on the attached plans

- All detailing, including materials, trim, windows and doors will meet current HDC policy
- This approval also includes the construction of a new garage as shown on the attached plans

This Certificate of Appropriateness indicates that the project proposal submitted to the Historic District Commission has been determined to comply with the standards and policies of the Charlotte Historic District Commission. No other approvals are to be inferred. All work must be completed in accordance with all other applicable state and local codes.

Any changes from or additions or deletions to the plans referenced herein will void this Certificate, and a new application must be filed with the Historic District Commission.

This Certificate is valid for a period of six months from the date of issuance. Failure to obtain a building permit in that time will be considered as a failure to comply with the Certificate and the Certificate will become invalid. If a building permit is not required, then the approved work must be completed within six months of the date of issuance of this Certificate. The Certificate can be renewed within twelve months of its issuance by Historic District Commission staff by written request and submission of a valid reason for failure to comply within the six-month deadline.

[Signatures]
Chairman

[Signatures]
Staff

CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG PLANNING COMMISSION
www.charmeck.nc.us
600 East Fourth Street
Charlotte, NC 28202-2853
PH: 704/336-2203
FAX: 704/336-5123
1428 Thomas Avenue
Front Elevation

APPROVED
Charlotte Historic District Commission
Certificate of Appropriateness

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
COMPLIANCE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUIRED
7/19/07
1428 Thomas Avenue
Right Elevation

Approved
Charlotte Historic District Commission
Certificate of Appropriateness
# 2007-56-PM-08

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
COMPLIANCE WITH
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
REQUIRED 7/15/07
CERTIFICATE NUMBER: HDC 2013-152  DATE: April 11, 2014
ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1700 The Plaza
HISTORIC DISTRICT: Plaza Midwood  TAX PARCEL NUMBER: 09506206
OWNER(S): Andrea & Gennaro Lorusso

DETAILS OF APPROVED PROJECT: Addition to the left side with new windows on all three sides with siding to match the existing home. Replacement of paired windows on the left elevation at the rear, behind the addition, with smaller pair of windows. Addition of a full size window on the left side of the rear porch. Removal of right door on rear porch to be replaced with a window.

This Certificate of Appropriateness indicates that this project proposal has been determined to comply with the standards and policies of the Charlotte Historic District Commission.

No other approvals are to be inferred.
No demolition other than that specifically indicated on any attached plans is authorized under this approval.
All work must be completed in accordance with all other applicable state and local codes.
Any changes from or additions or deletions to the plans referenced herein will void this Certificate, and a new application must be filed with the Historic District Commission.

This Certificate is valid for a period of six months from the date of issuance. Failure to obtain a building permit in that time will be considered as a failure to comply with the Certificate and the Certificate will become invalid. If a building permit is not required, then the approved work must be completed within six months of the date of issuance of this Certificate. The Certificate can be renewed within twelve months of its issuance by Historic District Commission staff by written request and submission of a valid reason for failure to comply within the six-month deadline.

Chairman

Staff

www.charlotteplanning.org
600 East Fourth Street
Charlotte, NC 28202-2853
Ph. (704)-336-2205
Fax. (704)-336-8123
CHARLOTTE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

CERTIFICATE NUMBER: 2015-001
DATE: January 16, 2015

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1915 Thomas Avenue

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Plaza Midwood
TAX PARCEL NUMBER: 08119336

OWNER(S): Susan Stallings

DETAILS OF APPROVED PROJECT: The project is an addition to the right side of the house. The
addition will project approximately 4 feet into the side yard. New materials will match the
traditional materials on the existing structure including the brick foundation and wood siding. New
windows will match existing in trim details and design. See attached plans and notes.

The project was approved by the HDC January 14, 2015.

This Certificate of Appropriateness indicates that this project proposal has been determined to comply with the
standards and policies of the Charlotte Historic District Commission.
No other approvals are to be inferred.
No demolition other than that specifically indicated on any attached plans is authorized under this approval.
All work must be completed in accordance with all other applicable state and local codes.
Any changes from or additions or deletions to the plans referenced herein will void this Certificate, and a new
application must be filed with the Historic District Commission.

This Certificate is valid for a period of six months from the date of issuance. Failure to obtain a building permit in
that time will be considered as a failure to comply with the Certificate and the Certificate will become invalid. If a
building permit is not required, then the approved work must be completed within six months of the date of
issuance of this Certificate. The Certificate can be renewed within twelve months of its issuance by Historic District
Commission staff by written request and submission of a valid reason for failure to comply within the six-month
deadline.

Chairman

Staff
THE PLAZA ELEVATION (WEST) - EXISTING

HATCH INDICATES EXIST. ELEVATION TO REMAIN (MODIFICATIONS NOTED)

HATCH ELEVATION TO REMAIN (MODIFICATIONS NOTED)

THE PLAZA ELEVATION (WEST) - PROPOSED

ALL NEW WINDOWS TO BE JELD-WEN
WOOD SDL WITH SHADOWBANDS IN CONFIGURATIONS SHOWN
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION COMPLIANCE WITH
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUIRED 4/11/2014
HATCH INDICATES EXIST. ELEVATION TO REMAIN
(MODIFICATIONS NOTED)

KENNINGTON DR. ELEVATION (SOUTH) - EXISTING
A2 SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

KENNINGTON DR. ELEVATION (SOUTH) - PROPOSED
A2 SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

studio home design
Jessica Hindman 720 e. femond ave charlotte, nc 28203
704-995-3805 studiodesign.com

KENNINGTON DR. (SIDE) ELEVATION (SOUTH)
A2.1
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
COMPLIANCE WITH
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
RK REQUIRED 4/11/2014

HATCH INDICATES EXIST. ELEVATION TO REMAIN
(MODIFICATIONS NOTED)

ALL NEW WINDOWS TO BE JELD-WEN WOOD SASH WITH
SHADOWBARS IN CONFIGURATIONS SHOWN

NEW RAKE, EAVE,
# BRACKET TO MATCH EXIST.
NEW WOOD HORIZ.
LAP SIDING TO MATCH EXIST. B1
EXP.
NEW CORNERBOARDS,
SKIRT, APRON TO MATCH EXIST.

REAR ELEVATION (SOUTH) - EXISTING
A2/3 SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

REAR ELEVATION (SOUTH) - PROPOSED
A2/3 SCALE: 1/8"=1'-0"

studio home design
Jessica Hindman
720 s bonneire ave
charlotte, nc 28203
704-995-3605
studiodesign.com

REAR ELEVATION (EAST)
A2.2
SIDE ELEVATION (NORTH) - EXISTING

SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

SIDE ELEVATION (NORTH) - PROPOSED

SCALE: 1/8" = 1'-0"

NEW CORNERBOARDS, SKIRT, & APRON TO MATCH EXIST.

HATCH INDICATES EXIST. ELEVATION TO RETAIN (MODIFICATIONS NOTED)

NEW RAKE, EAVE, & BRACKET TO MATCH EXIST.

ALL NEW WINDOWS TO BE JELD-WEN WOOD SDL WITH SHADE/BARS IN CONFIGURATIONS SHOWN

NEW WOOD HORIZONTAL LAP SIDING TO MATCH EXIST. 5" EXPF.
CHARLOTTE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

CERTIFICATE NUMBER: 2014-191

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1511 The Plaza

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Plaza Midwood

TAX PARCEL NUMBER: 08118703

OWNER(S): Larry Nabatoff and Kelly Katterhagen

DETAILS OF APPROVED PROJECT: The project is an addition to the rear and right of the principal dwelling. A one story addition will be constructed at the left-rear corner. The two story addition to the right-rear will include a covered rear porch and living space above. The dining porch and second story above will be visible from the street. Details include painted brick foundation, wood siding or cedar shingles, roof trim to match existing, wood windows and slate flooring on the porch. See attached plans.

The project was approved by the HDC September 10, 2014.

➢ This Certificate of Appropriateness indicates that this project proposal has been determined to comply with the standards and policies of the Charlotte Historic District Commission.
➢ No other approvals are to be inferred.
➢ No demolition other than that specifically indicated on any attached plans is authorized under this approval.
➢ All work must be completed in accordance with all applicable state and local codes.
➢ Any changes from or additions or deletions to the plans referenced herein will void this Certificate, and a new application must be filed with the Historic District Commission.

This Certificate is valid for a period of six months from the date of issuance. Failure to obtain a building permit in that time will be considered as a failure to comply with the Certificate and the Certificate will become invalid. If a building permit is not required, then the approved work must be completed within six months of the date of issuance of this Certificate. The Certificate can be renewed within twelve months of its issuance by Historic District Commission staff by written request and submission of a valid reason for failure to comply within the six-month deadline.

Tom Egan
Chairman

John W. Donnell
Staff

CHARLOTTE-MECKLENBURG PLANNING DEPARTMENT

www.charlottplanning.org

600 East Fourth Street
Charlotte, NC 28202-2853
P: (704) 357-3500
F: (704) 357-6123
PROPOSED PARTIAL EAST ELEVATION

one eighth of an inch equals a foot
PROPOSED NORTH ELEVATION

EXISTING NORTH ELEVATION