LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: Dilworth

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 1701 Park Road

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: New Construction - Single Family Home

OWNER: Brennan and Colleen Giggey

APPLICANT: Connie and Frank Reed

Details of Proposed Request - Demolition

Existing Conditions
This c. 1920 house is identified as Contributing in the National Register of Historic Places Inventory. It appears as it has for many years but the understanding is that it is completely gutted to the exterior walls. Demolition is being requested. This property qualifies for Preservation Tax Credits because it is located within a National Register Neighborhood. It is a 1.5 story Colonial Revival design with balanced fenestration along the façade and a covered entrance. The exterior is wood shingle siding. The home is set back slightly from the adjacent homes on either side.

Determination of Substantial Change
The proposal was denied in November 2013 based on non-compliance with the guidelines for Size, Scale and Massing. Before deliberating on the current project the Commission must determine if the applicant has made substantial changes to the previous plan. Based on the current submittal the following revisions have been made:

1. The roof has been redesigned as a series of hip forms.
2. The setback is more consistent with the houses to either side.
3. Context images are included to show the house in comparison to those on the block.
4. The overall design concept of the home has not changed.

Staff believes the revised roof design has improved the massing and scale of the home resulting in a substantial change.

Proposal
The proposed project is a new 2 story home on a lot that slopes downward from right to left. The front setback will be in alignment with adjacent homes. The overall height of the home is approximately 31’-9” measured from the finished floor to the ridge. The adjacent homes are approximately 18’-7” and 30’-10” as noted on the plans, measured from the finished floor. The roof form is a series of hips with exposed rafter ends. The front porch has stone piers with tapered columns supporting the roof. Windows are 3 over 1. Access to the garage is through a porte-cochere with conditioned space above it. Siding is a combination of cedar shake on the lower level and wood lap siding on the upper levels. Trim banding is continued on all sides. The roof features exposed rafter ends.
Policy & Design Guidelines for New Construction

HDC Design Policy requires that new construction be evaluated according to the following:

| All New Construction Projects Will Be Evaluated For Compatibility By The Following Criteria |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. **Size**                     | the relationship of the project to its site                                    |
| 2. **Scale**                    | the relationship of the building to those around it                           |
| 3. **Massing**                  | the relationship of the building’s various parts to each other                 |
| 4. **Fenestration**             | the placement, style and materials of windows and doors                       |
| 5. **Rhythm**                   | the relationship of fenestration, recesses and projections                     |
| 6. **Setback**                  | in relation to setback of immediate surroundings                              |
| 7. **Materials**                | proper historic materials or approved substitutes                              |
| 8. **Context**                  | the overall relationship of the project to its surroundings                    |
| 9. **Landscaping**              | as a tool to soften and blend the project with the district                    |

**Staff Analysis – Updated for February 2014 Hearing**

The Commission should consider the following:

1. Scale
2. Massing

Staff believes the proposal meets the remaining guidelines for new construction.
DENIED IN NOVEMBER

Aerial of Context
Scale: 1"=40'-0"

Existing vs. New
Scale: 1"=40'-0"

Zoning Setback Summary:
Zoning: R-5
Required Setback: 30 ft.
Required Side yard Setback: 5 feet
Required Rear Yard Setback: 40 feet
Architectural Features (Eaves, Cornices, Etc.)
Allowed to project up to 3 feet into any required yard

Accessory Structure Setbacks:
Side Yard: 5 feet
Rear Yard: 3 feet
No architectural feature of any feature on the accessory building shall project into the setback.

New Residence Setbacks:
Front Yard Setback: 39'-6"
Left Sideyard Setback: 5'-0"
Right Sideyard Setback: 5'-10"
Architectural Feature Encroachment: 1'-10"

Accessory Structure Setbacks:
Sideyard: 10' and 16'
Rearyard: 5'-0"
Overhang: 2'-0"

New stone walk.
New driveway within property lines.

Issue Date:
09.18.13 HDC Initial
11.04.13 HDC Final

Job Number: 13-13
Drawn By: OLG
DENIED IN NOVEMBER

New Streetscape
Scale: \( \frac{1}{16''} = 1'-0'' \)

Existing Streetscape
Scale: NTS

- Issue Date:
  - 09.18.13 HDC Review
  - 10.01.13 HDC Final

- Job Number: 13-13
- Drawn By: CLG
DENIED IN NOVEMBER

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)

Board And Batten Siding

Exposed Rafter Tails

Trim Band

3 Over One Double-Hung Windows
(Transoms At First Floor)

Cedar Shake Siding

Stone Foundation
(Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)

Front Elevation
Scale: 1/8" = 1' 0"

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)

Board And Batten Siding

Exposed Rafter Tails

Trim Band

Cedar Shake Siding

Stone Foundation
(Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)

Left Side Elevation
Scale: 1/8" = 1' 0"
DENIED IN NOVEMBER

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)

Board And Batten Siding

Exposed Rafter Tails

Trim Band

3 Over One Double-Hung Windows

Cedar Shake Siding

Stone Foundation
(Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)

Rear Elevation
Scale 1/8" = 1 0"

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)

Board And Batten Siding

Exposed Rafter Tails

Trim Band

3 Over One Double-Hung Windows
(Transoms At First Floor)

Cedar Shake Siding

Stone Foundation
(Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)

Right Side Elevation
Scale 1/8" = 1 0"
DENIED IN NOVEMBER

Material Section Axonometric
Scale: NTS

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)
Exposed Rafter Tails
Board And Batten Siding
Trim Band
Cedar Shake Siding
3 Over One Double-Hung Windows
Cedar Shake Siding
Stone Foundation
Board And Batten Siding

Worthington Road Precendent
Scale: NTS

Dilworth Road West Precedent
Scale: NTS

Material Palette and Precedence

Reed Residence
New Residence
1701 Park Road
Charlotte, NC 28203

Issue Date:
09.18.13 HDC Review
10.01.13 HDC Final

Job Number: 13-13
Drawn By: CLG

A5
FEBRUARY 2014

Aerial of Context

Scale: 1"=40'-0"  

Existing Residence

New Residence

Existing Outbuilding

New Outbuilding

Existing Tree To Remain

Existing Curb Cut To Be Reused

Park Road

Current driveway encroaches on neighbor's property

Existing Residence

Existing Outbuilding

New Residence

Existing Residence

Zoning Setback Summary:

Zoning: R-5
Required Setback: 30 ft.
Required Side Yard Setback: 5 feet
Required Rear Yard Setback: 40 feet
Architectural Features (Eaves, Cornices, Etc.)
Allowed to project up to 3 feet into any required yard

Architectural Feature Encroachment: 1'-10"

Accessory Structure Setbacks:
Side Yard: 5 feet
Rear Yard: 3 Feet
No architectural feature of any feature on the accessory building shall project into the setback.

Existing vs. New

Scale: 1"=40'-0"

New Residence Setbacks:
Front Yard Setback: 39'-6"
Left Sideyard Setback: 5'-0"
Right Sideyard Setback: 5'-10"
Architectural Feature Encroachment: 1'-10"

Accessory Structure Setbacks:
Sideyard: 10' and 16'
Rearyard: 3'-0"
Overhang: 2'-0"

New stone walk.

New driveway within property lines.

Issue Date:
01.15.14 HDC Initial

Job Number: 13-13

Drawn By: CLG
Proposed Streetscape
Scale: NTS

Proposed View From East Blvd.
Scale: NTS
New Streetscape
Scale: NTS

Existing Streetscape
Scale: NTS
Reed Residence
New Residence
1701 Park Road
Charlotte, NC 28203

Issue Date: 01.15.14 HDC Initial
Job Number: 13-13
Drawn By: CLG

Exterior Elevations

Front Elevation
Scale: 1/8" = 1' 0"

Asphalt Shingle Roof (Standing Seam At Porch)
Exposed Rafter Tails
German Lap Siding
Trim Band
3 Over One Double-Hung Windows (Transoms At First Floor)
Cedar Shake Siding
Stone Foundation (Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)

Left Side Elevation
Scale: 1/8" = 1' 0"

Asphalt Shingle Roof (Standing Seam At Porch)
Exposed Rafter Tails
Trim Band
Cedar Shake Siding
Stone Foundation (Stone Columns At Porte Cochere)
FEBRUARY 2014

Material Section Axonometric
Scale: NTS

Asphalt Shingle Roof
(Standing Seam At Porch)
Exposed Rafter Tails
German Lap Siding with Corner Boards
Trim Band
Cedar Shake Siding
3 Over One Double-Hung Windows
Stone Foundation

Kingston Avenue Precendent
Scale: NTS

Dilworth Road West Precendent
Scale: NTS