LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT: Dilworth

ADDRESS OF PROPERTY: 723 East Worthington Avenue

SUMMARY OF REQUEST: Porch Enclosure, Addition, and New Construction (Garage)

OWNER: Edward Vinson

APPLICANT: Edward Vinson

Details of Proposed Request

Existing Conditions
The subject property is 1.5 story Bungalow with wood shingle siding, cross gabled roof, and decorative joists. The c. 1925 house is listed as a Contributing structure.

Proposal
The proposed projects are a conversion of the rear screened porch to a liveable space, addition of a mud room, and construction of a new carriage house. The rear porch enclosure is not visible from the street.

The proposed addition of a mud room is located to the side of the rear porch and partially visible from the street. The exterior materials and trim details would match the existing house.

The proposed carriage house/garage possesses details from the principal structure such as exterior materials, post-pier design, window design and cross gable roof. The structure is smaller in scale to the principal dwelling.

Policy & Design Guidelines for Enclosure of Existing Porches (Page 43)

Porches are an important part of the residential sections of older neighborhoods. The Historic District Commission strongly discourages porch enclosures in an effort to maintain the design integrity of both individual buildings and the overall streetscape in historic districts.

1. All proposals for the enclosure of all or any part of a front, side or rear porch which are substantially visible from a street will be reviewed by the full Historic District Commission.

2. It is not appropriate to enclose a front porch or balcony on the front of an historic building. The full enclosure of a front porch is not allowed.

3. Front porch enclosures that reorient the entrance away from the street elevation of a building are not allowed.

4. Enclosure of side porches and balconies is discouraged. If enclosure of a side porch or balcony is required for a new use, the enclosure should be designed to ensure that the historic character and features of the porch are preserved.
5. All porch enclosures must be plausibly reversible. Permanent elements that could preclude the reversibility of the enclosed porch are not allowed.

**Policy & Design Guidelines for Additions**

| 1. All additions will be reviewed for compatibility by the following criteria: |
|---|---|
| a. **Size** | the relationship of the project to its site |
| b. **Scale** | the relationship of the building to those around it |
| c. **Massing** | the relationship of the building’s various parts to each other |
| d. **Fenestration** | the placement, style and materials of windows and doors |
| e. **Rhythm** | the relationship of fenestration, recesses and projections |
| f. **Setback** | in relation to setback of immediate surroundings |
| g. **Materials** | proper historic materials or approved substitutes |
| h. **Context** | the overall relationship of the project to its surroundings |

2. Additions must respect the original character of the property, but must be distinguishable from the original construction.

3. All additions to the front or side of existing properties must be of a design that is sensitive to the character and massing of the existing structure.

4. Additions to the front or side of existing structures that are substantially visible from a street must go before the full Commission.

**Policy & Design Guidelines for Garages/New Construction**

1. New garages cannot be located in front or side yards.

2. New garages must be constructed using materials and finishes that are in keeping with the main building they serve, and that are appropriate to the district.

3. Designs for new garages must be inspired by the main building they serve. Building details should be derived from the main structure.

4. Garages must be of a proper scale for the property, and must have an appropriate site relation to the main structure on a lot and to structures on surrounding properties.

5. Garage doors that are substantially visible from any street must be of a style and materials that are appropriate to the building and the district. Stamped metal and vinyl doors are considered to be inappropriate, and are discouraged.
Staff Analysis

I. Porch Enclosure

1. The Commission should consider the ability to reverse the porch enclosure.

II. Addition

The following Guidelines should be considered for the side addition:

1. Fenestration – Front elevation
2. Rhythm

Staff believes the addition meets Guidelines for Size, Scale, Massing, Setback, Materials, and Context.

III. Garage

Staff believes the addition meets all applicable Guidelines.

### All New Construction Projects Will Be Evaluated For Compatibility By The Following Criteria

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td><strong>Size</strong> the relationship of the project to its site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td><strong>Scale</strong> the relationship of the building to those around it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td><strong>Massing</strong> the relationship of the building's various parts to each other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td><strong>Fenestration</strong> the placement, style and materials of windows and doors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td><strong>Rhythm</strong> the relationship of fenestration, recesses and projections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td><strong>Setback</strong> in relation to setback of immediate surroundings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td><strong>Materials</strong> proper historic materials or approved substitutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td><strong>Context</strong> the overall relationship of the project to its surroundings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td><strong>Landscaping</strong> as a tool to soften and blend the project with the district</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NOTES:
Site plan information taken from survey by Andrew G. Zoutewelle. Dated November 19th 2003
No mature trees to be affected or removed

PROPOSED SITE PLAN

EXISTING ALLEY
PROPERTY LINE

NEW
EXISTING
RENO.

GRAVEL DRIVEWAY
NEIGHBOR'S FENCE
EXISTING DRIVEWAY TO REMAIN

Mature oak tree to remain

EAST WORTHINGTON AVENUE 60°

Proposed Site Plan
© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.
723 E. Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203
Project #: 13_115
2923 S Tryon St, Suite 250
Charlotte NC 28203
704 405 5980
www.cluckdesign.com
723WORTHINGTON AVE

Existing Left Neighbors

Existing Front Elevation

Existing Right Neighbors

Context

© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.

723 E Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203

Project #: 13_115
Existing Materials and Details
Existing Rear View

723 E. Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203

Project #: 13_115
Proposed 1st & 2nd Floor Plan

2nd Floor Plan

1st Floor Plan
Proposed Carriage Roof Plan

Proposed Roof Plan
New cedar shakes to match existing

New brick base to match existing

New roof detailing and trim to match existing on house

New asphalt shingles to match existing

Existing Front Elevation

Proposed Front Elevation

© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE.
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.

723 E. Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203
Project #: 13_115
704 405 5980
www.cluckdesign.com
Proposed Left Elevation

© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.
CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE
2103 S. Tryon St., Suite 250
Charlotte, NC 28203
704 405 5590
www.cluckdesign.com
New windows to match existing window style

New cedar shakes to match existing

New roof trim to match existing

New asphalt shingles to match existing

New brick to match existing

Project #: 13_115

723 E. Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203

© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE. ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.
New asphalt shingles to match existing
New wood shingles to match existing
New roof detailing and trim to match existing detailing on house
New windows to match existing window style
New roof angles to match existing roof angles of 7:12
New cedar shakes to match existing
Proposed Carriage House Front Elevation

Brick column to match existing column at front of house
New trim to match existing trim on front porch of house
New cedar shakes to match existing on house
New asphalt shingles to match existing on house
Roof detailing and trim to match existing house trim
Decorative metal screen panel
Proposed Carriage House Rear Elevation

© 2013 CLUCK DESIGN COLLABORATIVE.
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.

723 E. Worthington Ave
Charlotte, NC 28203
Project #: 13_115