



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

March 28, 2013

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Timothy Bender  
Dr. Lili Corbus  
Mr. Don Duffy  
Mr. Tom Egan  
Ms. I-Mei Ervin  
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair  
Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair  
Mr. Tom Low  
Mr. Brad Norvell  
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. Roger Dahnert  
Mr. Brad Norvell  
Ms. Lisa Yarbrough

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission  
Ms. Linda Keich, Historic District Commission Support  
Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present Chairman George called the regular March meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:09 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the

project. Next, members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again, there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

|                     |                         |                 |
|---------------------|-------------------------|-----------------|
| Index of Addresses: | 700 East Tremont Avenue | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1122 Buchanan Street    | Dilworth        |
|                     | 801 Romany Road         | Dilworth        |
|                     | 520 East Tremont Avenue | Dilworth        |
|                     | 824 East Park Avenue    | Dilworth        |
|                     | Tremont/Euclid Avenues  | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1003 Romany Road        | Dilworth        |
|                     | 922 East Park Avenue    | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1201 Belgrave Place     | Dilworth        |
|                     | 412 East Tremont Avenue | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1528 Thomas Avenue      | Plaza Midwood   |
|                     | 601 N Poplar Street     | Fourth Ward     |
|                     | 600 Hermitage Court     | Hermitage Court |
|                     | 425 Rensselaer Avenue   | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1315 Lexington Avenue   | Dilworth        |
|                     | 1915 Springdale Avenue  | Dilworth        |

Application: 700 East Tremont - Addition/Renovation

An application for an addition and renovation has recently been reviewed and deferred for further design study. A garage with entry from the side street is attached to the new rear additions of the house. The front door will be reoriented to the street. A courtyard will be designed between the house the new garage with the connector/breezeway on one side.

The plan from last month called for a second story addition with an attached garage that will be in the rear of the house . The commission liked the details of materials and the massing. They asked for further design study on detaching the garage.

Jessica stated she is looking for a gut check and seeking conceptual approval

Applicant Comments: Architect Jessica Hindman said the breezeway is envisioned to be very glassy and will be a hallway to the master bedroom above the garage. The intent is to match all details, roof slope, rafter tails, and overhang.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition to the proposed plans.  
Neighborhood Resident Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition to the proposed plans.

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the plans IN CONCEPT with the breezeway/hallway to be rethought, the terrace minimized and pushed back, details to be worked out, and landscaping to be submitted. Ms. Ervin seconded.

VOTE: 6/3 AYES: DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: BENDER, CORBUS, GLENNON

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED IN CONCEPT WITH FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

---

Mr. Ristaino declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the next application.

---

Application: 1122 Buchanan Street – Addition.

A second story addition is planned for this story and one half house. This address faces the side of St Patrick's Cathedral.

The commission reviewed this application last month and approved it in concept. They asked that further design study provide a first story front that visually supports the new upper weight and more appropriate fenestration on the left side.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions*** Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE as submitted. Tom seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

---

Application: 801 Romany Road

This is a c. 1951 two story brick house that overlooks Latta Park. There is a two story gable element on the left front. A screened porch on the side will be removed. The gable facing the street on the left will be flared out to accommodate the two story element being increased in size to a little over one half of the front of the house. Fenestration will continue to be matching and balanced both on the front and on the side. Materials (including brick, roofing, windows, etc.) and details (including window configuration, soffit/fascia treatment, overhang, quoins, etc.) will match existing.

Staff Recommendation: HDC will determine if the addition can be approved based on the incorporation of addition criteria requirements.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions**, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the ADDITION with revised drawings to staff which show a single double hung window added in the blank space to the left elevation and a window added to left of side door. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH REVISED PLANS TO SHOW ADDED WINDOWS.

---

Application: 520 East Tremont – Addition

This is an application for a second rear addition. One two story, cross gable addition exists behind the existing one story c. 1915 frame house. A new rear facing gable addition will attach to the cross gable at the ridge.

Applicant Comments: Architect Susan Pfahl pointed out that the most recent drawings were not being shown in the power point.

NOTE: Following the advice of Assistant City Attorney Thomas Powers, it was decided that this application would not be heard until the correct plans were available to all.

---

Application: 824 East Park Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1941 one and one-half story brick house overlooks Latta Park. Plans show an addition which increases the front cross gable roof, a new shed dormer on the front roof slope, raising the chimney, cedar shakes on the new upper part. New rear facing gabled addition will tie back to house below new ridge.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident Marcia Rouse spoke in support of the project.

MOTION: Based on probable compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the plans with revisions to staff which will show: either a shed dormer on the front or elimination of dormer and increased windows on the side, a gabled dormer would have a single window with or without shutters, all shake notes changed to lapped wood or brick on the sides. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0                      AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON,  
LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: Staff to review final revised drawings.

---

Application: East Tremont/ Euclid Avenue – Redevelopment/New Construction

54 1 bedroom apartment units are planned for this block. The configuration will be a U-shaped building facing both streets with parking in the rear. The facades are stepped back for front porches.

Applicant Comments: Developer/Buyer David Ransenberg said he is interested in making sure the material choices are HDC approved ones.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition of the application.

Neighborhood Resident Jack Fenlon spoke in opposition of the application.

Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition of the application.

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made MOTION to defer the application. It was suggested that revised plans will show a reduction in density, a stepping down – transition to the single family adjacent houses, a break/separation in the roofline, and the saving of any trees possible, more thought given to adjacent properties.

SUBSTITUTE MOTION: Ms. Ervin made a SUBSTITUTE MOTION to DENY. This MOTION died for lack of a second.

AYES: 7/2                      AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, RISTAINO

NAYS: ERVIN, LOW

DECISION: THE APPLICATION IS DEFERRED.

---

Application:                      922 East Park Avenue – New Construction.

This empty lot overlooks Latta Park. It was part of the large side yard for the house facing Dilworth Road West. They were able to modify the house on its lot and carve out two additional lots. The house and the lot closest to the intersection have been sold.

A three story home with a center bay front door and porch/French doors with balcony above/gable in roof. Center roof gable will be flanked by small gabled dormers. A two story addition will project from each side. A Palladian window arrangement will be in gable end, third floor, of the right and left side elevations. Rear elevation shows a shed dormer on the third floor and a large chimney on the first floor.

Applicant Comments: Architect Angie Lauer said what is proposed is a 2 story with attic space for a play room. The finished floor measurement lines up with adjacent houses. She pointed out that this lot is 75' wide rather than the adjacent 50' wide lots. The house lines up with the other houses, while following the curve of the street.

FOR/AGAINST:                      Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition of the application.

Neighborhood Resident Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition of the application

Neighborhood Resident Joe Huneycutt spoke in opposition of the application

Neighborhood Resident Josie Bulla spoke in opposition of the application

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made MOTION to defer the application. It was suggested that revised plans will show 1) more articulation of the front, 2) Roof on top of windows, 3) Streetscape, 4) Context drawing, 5) scale and massing details, 6) Roof shortened, 7) Reduce gutter to gutter height, 8) more transition to corner, 9) more specific details, 10) Context details, 11) Size of house relative to lot. Dr. Corbus seconded

AYES: 8/1 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: GEORGE

DECISION: THE APPLICATION IS DEFERRED.

---

Application: 1003 Romany Road – New Construction

This address is a lot at the corner of Romany Road and Lexington Avenue. This lot was the side yard of the adjacent Romany Road house. It was carved off to become a legal lot of record and sold. This is a new application for a two story brick house with a front porch. A front facing gable will be centered on the upper roof, flanked by matching shed dormers. A one story element with a chimney to the street will face the side street. The rear elevation has a large shed dormer that is pulled in from the sides and projects out in the center. Lower level includes porch with chimney. A detached single car garage has office space above with a pair of windows over carriage style garage doors and a shed dormer and porch/entry/stair facing into the yard and back toward the house. The Commission recently reviewed the application and deferred it. Accurate design development drawings (to include materials, dimensions, and the front thermal wall to be within three feet of the established setback) will be submitted for further review.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident John Phares spoke in opposition of the application.

Neighborhood Resident Marcia Rouse spoke in opposition of the application

Neighborhood Resident Kirkwood Otey spoke in opposition of the application

Neighborhood Resident Brian Moraics spoke in favor of the application

Neighborhood Resident Joe Honeycutt spoke in favor of the application

Applicant Comments: Angie Lauer stated that they are well within the legal setbacks for zoning. This is a new application and should be looked at what we are submitting now.

MOTION: Mr. Egan made MOTION to defer the application. It was suggested that revised plans will show 1) maintain within 3' established setback, 2) streetscape up Lexington, 3) Detail drawing, accurate construction drawing, 4) ¼ scale des dev drawing, 5) materials, 6) dimensions, 7) front thermal wall within 3' of established setback. Mr. Duffy seconded

AYES: 8/1                      AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON,  
LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: THE APPLICATION IS DEFERRED.

---

Application:                      1528 Thomas Avenue - Addition

Small addition to the side rear addition. Cross gable roof will be raised to accommodate a two story rear addition. New side to side shed dormer will be added to rear. Existing rear facing gable will be removed and space will be incorporated into the new addition. New roofing material will be metal on the shed roof.

Rear shed dormer with 3 pairs of windows, materials and details will match existing. Match 1' overhang of garage

FOR/AGAINST: No one spoke for or against Ms. George's invitation to speak.

MOTION: Based on compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions**, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE as drawn.

VOTE: 9/0                      AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON,  
LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED

---

Ms. Ervin recused herself because of a conflict of interest.

---



Application: 601 N. Poplar – Addition

An addition is proposed to the rear of this Landmark home in Fourth Ward. This large Victorian house is at the corner of Poplar Street and 9th Street beside the bubbler fountain and across from the parking lot of Edwin Towers. This proposal is for a three story addition and incorporates a previous rear addition. There have been changes that the Historic Landmarks Commission required for approval.

Staff Recommendation: The Commission will review the details, finishes, massing, scale, size to determine the impact on the house and its surroundings. It is a very prominent house and basically visible from every angle. Fourth Ward's Zoning allows much more density in the way of lot coverage than other neighborhoods. The site plan indicates that the proposal is within the identified building envelope.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident Fred Ervin spoke in opposition of the application

MOTION: Based on compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions**, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE as drawn.

VOTE: 5/3                      AYES: BENDER, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, RISTAINO

NAYS: CORBUS, GLENNON, LOW

DECISION:      APPLICATION APPROVED

---

Application: 600 Hermitage Court – Rear Addition

This c. 1950 multifamily building is located mid-block in the Hermitage Court Local Historic District. It is listed as Non Contributing in the Myers Park National Register Survey. Integrated metal rear stairs for the upper units which ran by the windows of the lower units have been removed. A new wooden stairway extends from the middle of the upper porch, out into the back yard, with a landing just before the ground that diverts one to steps to the left and right. A stylized Chippendale rail is on the new stairway. Lower units have their same concrete steps to the ground with the new stairs above.

Staff Recommendation: This came to the agenda as an item that did not have prior approval. Approval would be in order, if the requirement to paint or stain is made. There are no further Zoning issues with the staircase. Additions to existing structures in Local Historic Districts have a responsibility to complement the original structure. Additions should reflect the design, scale and architectural style of the original structure. The following guidelines are intended to encourage addition designs that are compatible with the existing structure, while not fully or always having to mimic the original design.

FOR/AGAINST: No one spoke for or against Ms. Georges invitation to speak.

MOTION: Based on compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions**, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE as drawn. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED

---

Mr Ristaino recused himself from this application due to a conflict of interest.

---

Application: 425 Rensselaer Avenue – Garage

A story and one half garage was staff approved. The garage has been framed up as a full two story garage. The zoning inspector has issued a notice of violation. The owner is seeking approval to complete the garage as it is being built. Materials include lapped wood siding.

MOTION: Based on non-compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines- Garages**, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to DENY this application based on size, scale and mass. Ms. Ervin seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW

DECISION: APPLICATION DENIED

---

Application: 1315 Lexington Avenue– New Construction

New Construction. A proposed two story house has a front elevation expressed as a story and one half with a cross gable behind a front facing gable and a shed dormer. Hipped entry element is supported by columns on piers. Large, sweeping, side to side gable faces the right elevation with a hipped roof projection on the first floor. The left elevation gable is broken with a sleeping porch dormer. Materials include shaker siding, ½ timbers, brick, etc. Details include appropriate rails, trim, window configuration, etc. Detached garage is designed as a companion building appropriately detailed.

Staff Recommendation: Commission will determine appropriateness based on new construction criteria for mass, scale, size, materials and architecture seem to be in compliance.

FOR/AGAINST: No one spoke for or against this application.

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made a Motion to APPROVE IN CONCEPT with the following to come back need scale exhibit, need to see plans height, relationship, setback, trees, driveway - how. Mr. Egan seconded the motion.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS:

DECISION: APPROVED IN CONCEPT

---

Application: 1201 Belgrave Place– Rear addition – 12”

Addition of new outdoor living space on rear. New room will have a gabled roof with a chimney at the end facing into the back yard. The new porch/living space will be slightly offset from the house toward the side property line, making this a full Commission issue. Details include wide openings, columns, brick, louvered wooden shutters, etc. Sport court and deck extension can be approved administratively.

Staff Recommendation: Staff would have approved this, but, for the offset element  
FOR/AGAINST:NONE.

MOTION: Based on compliance with **Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions**, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to APPROVE as drawn but want applicant to fix hip roof gable. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS:

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED

---

Application: 412 East Tremont – Side addition

An addition is planned for the side of this house near the back corner. The c. 1925 house is identified as Contributing in the Dilworth National Register Survey. A new side gable will face the side. A new porch entry will face the front with details to match the front porch. Details will match the existing house. HardiePlank is proposed as the siding to closely match the existing asbestos siding. The driveway will be shortened by the addition but a car can still be in the driveway and out of the front setback.

Staff Recommendation: HDC will review the proposal based on the Policy and Design Guidelines on additions. Consideration will be discussed about shortening the driveway and the substitute siding material.

FOR/AGAINST: No one spoke for or against this application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines- Additions***, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to APPROVE as drawn with wood siding . Ms. Ervin seconded

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: BENDER, CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, ERVIN, GEORGE, GLENNON, LOW, RISTAINO

NAYS: None

DECISION: APPLICATION APPROVED WITH WOOD

---

The meeting adjourned at 11:19 with a meeting length of 8 hours and 10 minutes.

---

Linda Keich, Clerk to the Historic District Commission