

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

JULY 11, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT: Dr. Belinda, Corbus
Mr. Roger Dahnert
Mr. Don Duffy
Mr. Tom Egan
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair
Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair
Mr. Bradley Norvell
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair
Mr. Curtis Watkins
Ms. Lisa Yarbrough

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ms. E-Mei Ervin
One Vacancy

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the
Historic District Commission

With a quorum present Chairman George called the regular July meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:08 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Mr. Rogers welcomed the newly appointed member who is taking Karen Rush's recently vacated At Large seat. Dr. Lili Corbus is an art historian.

Mr. Rogers welcomed the newly appointed member who is taking Babs Highfill's recently vacated seat. Lisa Yarbrough is the new Hermitage Court representative.

Mr. Rogers reported that Steven Firestone declined reappointment. The Planning Commission has made a recommendation but the Mayor has yet to make the appointment.

Index of Addresses:	2128 The Plaza	Plaza Midwood
	315 West 9 th Street	Fourth Ward
	1119 Belgrave Place	Dilworth
	1819 Lyndhurst Avenue	Dilworth
	1513 Kennon Street	Plaza Midwood
	409 E. Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
	908/910 Lexington Ave.	Dilworth
	500 E. Tremont Ave.	Dilworth
	813 Walnut Avenue	Wesley Heights
	506 Hermitage Court	Hermitage Court

Mr. Ristaino declared a conflict of interest as an adjacent property owner for the first application and removed himself from the Commission.

Application: 2128 The Plaza – Addition.

This second story addition recently received conceptual approval. Proposed is a front to back ridge with a primary gable facing forward and a secondary gable tucked into the slope. The upper story will replicate the existing cross gable, a small rear porch will be enclosed, a shed dormer will be added, new roof pitches will be copied from existing.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the final plans. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: SECOND STORY ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 315 West 9th Street - Addition.

This rear addition was recently deferred for further design study and offered the benefit of Design Review. The addition is reworking a large two story existing rear addition, and reworking the front porch. Revised plans show a cross gable beyond the existing roof with no wall space showing from the front. A third story with a rear shed dormer ties below the new roof ridge. A Juliette balcony the rear will have three sets of French doors into the new rooms.

Design Review Report: Mr. Duffy and Mr. Ristaino commented that all changes have been made from the Design Review suggestions: casement to double hung windows, add fish scale detail and a band, alcove porch rather than columns, read 2 ½ story rather than full 3 story. The revised plans are much more organized and the transition is much more effective. The size is a struggle but it does relate to others in the context. It is a good solution.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study regarding mass, and detail of the rear addition modification, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED.

Mr. Dahnert arrived at 4:16 pm and was present for the remainder of the meeting.

Application: 1119 Belgrave Place – Garage.

This address backs up to businesses which face Morehead. The proposal is to add a brick garage with an upper floor at the end of the drive in the left rear corner of the yard. The garage will be 1 ½ stories with wood siding on the shed dormer on the front above the carriage style door, and a large side to side shed on the rear. Windows will be in gable ends.

Applicant Comments: Owner John Fryday said 18 years ago he planted a tree buffer along the rear and side with a fence also. The garage will be hidden in trees. The garage will be a matching companion to the house.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Accessory Structures***, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to APPROVE the garage with revised plans for staff to review which show: (1) dormer connecting lower than ridge, (2) boxing, (3) brick mold, (4) corner board detailing, (5) materials. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: GARAGE APPROVED WITH REVISED PLANS TO BE SUBMITTED FOR STAFF TO REVIEW.

Application: 401 East Boulevard – Tree Removal.

This address sits at the corner of East Boulevard and Euclid Avenue. It is a quad that was long ago converted to business. A rear parking lot has an island of trees along Euclid. Three pine trees tower over the buildings. The owner would like to remove the pines and replant the island.

Applicant Comments: Mr. Lowder said there are power lines everywhere and this space is the only opportunity for trees. They want to clean up the appearance.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the understanding that other trees would be more in keeping with the neighborhood, Mr. Curtis made a MOTION to APPROVE the tree removal. Digging will only be done if the whole area is cleared out to start over. It was suggested that maple trees should not be selected as they would not do well in the confined space. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: TREES MAY BE REMOVED.

Application: 1819 Lyndhurst Avenue – Addition.

This two story house has long been used as business or office. The application is for an addition to capture more usable space. The front porch is to be glassed in; a rear addition will include a front facing gable and gable to the side. The non-original front porch rail will be replaced with a ½ wall rail of sided in shakes.

Applicant Comments: Designer Mark Melaragno said the glass enclosure will be seamless and transparent with the front door remaining where it is with a full glass door at the top of the steps. The columns and rail have all been replaced in the past. An 80s era rear addition will be engaged into the new addition.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition IN CONCEPT. Final plans will show: all details, 1 ½ story addition on rear, front porch enclosure behind knee wall rail and columns. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 10/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, WATKINS, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED IN CONCEPT

Application: 1513 Kennon Street – Move House In.

This is the last lot in the Plaza Midwood Historic District. The owner is moving in a house from East 7th Street. It will be put back together as it was before the move and be lined up with the other three houses on this side of the street.

Applicant Comments: Owner Trent Tonsmeire said they had to remove the brick but new brick will be an exact match. An old upper rear addition was not moved and the door will be bricked over.

Mr. Watkins left at 6 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need to see complete information regarding new elevations, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON,
NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DEFERRED FOR MORE INFORMATION.

409 East Tremont Avenue – Front Addition.

The plan is to face the steps, columns, and sidewalks with stone. The risers will be stacked stone. The sidewalk will be bluestone. The concrete cap on the columns will be replaced with stone.

Applicant Comments: The owner said he likes the look of the stone and has seen it in the neighborhood.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to APPROVE: (1) entire rebuilt steps in the Biltmore stone – risers and treads, (2) keeping cheek walls in brick, (3) blue stone sidewalk. Dr. Corbus seconded.

VOTE: 8/1 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, GEORGE, GLENNON,
NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: EGAN

DECISION: CHANGES TO FRONT APPROVED.

Application: 908/910 Lexington Avenue – Tree Removal.

There is a stand of bushes and scrub trees along the property line that the owner wants to remove.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines - Tree Removal***, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to APPROVE the removal of the trees and overgrown bushes along the property line. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: TREES AND BUSHES ALONG PROPERTY LINE MAY BE REMOVED.

APPLICATION: 500 East Tremont Avenue – Demolition.

This tri-plex is at the corner of Tremont Avenue and Euclid Avenue in Dilworth has been purchased after being on the market for a long time. Several years the owners applied for Demolition and New Construction. Both were approved but it did not happen. New owners now are applying for Demolition while developing their plans for New Construction. The house is located in an area of Tremont Avenue that has long history of underground water issues. There is a convergence of water pipes below the ground. This house sits right on the ground and experiences water problems that can not be fixed. The house would have to be lifted and pumps installed and a foundation created.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on year house was built and it being original Dilworth fabric, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to recognize the house as a Contributing structure. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

MOTION: Based on the structure being recognized as Contributing, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to impose the 365 Day Stay of Demolition. The Commissions policy of not seeing New Construction plans for 90 days into the Stay is lifted. The remainder of the Stay will be considered for lifting with approved New Construction plans. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 6/3 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, EGAN, GEORGE, NORVELL, RISTAINO

NAYS: DUFFY, GLENNON, YARBROUGH

DECISION: HOUSE RECOGNIZED AS CONTRIBUTING. 365 DAY STAY OF DEMOLITION IMPOSED. NEW CONSTRUCTION PLANS MAY BE SUBMITTED AT ANY TIME. LIFTING REMAINDER OF STAY WILL BE CONSIDERED.

Application: 318 Walnut Avenue – Demolition.

This house is located far back on the lot near the back property line. It is a one story, wood sided house that is deteriorated and has water problems.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the year the house was built and it being original Wesley Height fabric, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to recognize the house as a Contributing structure. Dr. Corbus seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

MOTION: Based on the building being recognized as Contributing, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to impose the 365 Day Stay of Demolition. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NORVELL, RISTAINO, YARBROUGH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: HOUSE RECOGNIZED AS CONTRIBUTING. 365 DAY STAY OF DEMOLITION IMPOSED.

Ms. Yarbrough declared a conflict of interest as and adjacent property owner and removed herself from the Commission for the next application.

Application: 506 Hermitage Court – Side Addition.

A side terrace exists. Changes are proposed to the entry, driveway, terrace.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for more information, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: CORBUS, DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON,
NORVELL, RISTAINO

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED.

- Mr. Rogers said we will have a Retreat sometime soon. The agenda will include discussion about the HDC's quasi-judicial nature, and HDC policies. In the past we start with lunch and continue for the afternoon.

June MINUTES were unanimously approved as submitted with the instruction to contact Mrs. Birmingham with any changes, correction, or addition.

The meeting adjourned at 8:00 pm with a meeting length of 4 hours and 52 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission