HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

February 8, 2012

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Mr. Steven Firestone

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Ms. Debra Glennon, 2\textsuperscript{nd} Vice Chair

Ms. Barbara Highfill

Ms. Paula Owens

Ms. Karen Rush

Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

MEMBERS ABSENT: NONE

One Vacancy
With a quorum present Ms. George called the regular February meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:08 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the city Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY< or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses: 

2012, 2016, 2020 Euclid Avenue        Dilworth
1432 Pecan Avenue                  Plaza Midwood
323 Rensselaer Avenue             Dilworth
Ms. Glennon declared a conflict of interest and removed herself from the Commission for the first application.


This is a proposed redevelopment that includes the removal of five houses – three are in the Dilworth Local Historic District and two are not. Applicants are requesting that the remainder of the Stay of Demolition be lifted so the project which has Conceptual Approval from the Commission may begin site work while final details are being worked out. A site plan, including topo, is submitted with changes made to the building from previous meetings. The units facing Euclid have a single family look with other units, which face the interior, lining up behind.

Applicant Comments: Architect Richard Bartlett said they are looking at cementitious board siding. HVAC will be located on the roofs or on patios.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on expected compliance with Policy & Design Guidelines – New Construction, Mr. Dahner made a MOTION that staff may sign off on final
plans which will include all details including appropriate overhang, rails, columns, and doors, etc. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 10/0  AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: STAFF MAY SIGN OFF ON COMPLETED PLANS.

Application: 1432 Pecan Avenue – Tree Removal

This house is at the corner of Pecan Avenue and School Street. A tree grows very close to the right front corner of the front porch. Owners would like to remove the leaning tree. The front yard is so small they do not want to replant.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on exception due to volunteer tree in wrong place of very small yard to Policy & Design Guidelines – Landscaping, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to APPROVE the tree removal with no replanting requirement. Ms. Rush seconded.
VOTE: 11/0  AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: TREE MAY BE REMOVED FROM FRONT YARD.

Application: 323 Rensselaer Avenue – Addition.

A second story is proposed. The footprint will not change on the front and only on a corner on the rear. This will become a full two story house with side facing dormers.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition with revised plans which for staff to see which show: (1) thermal wall lined up, (2) open soffit, (3) bracket detail, (4) appropriate bracket detail, (5) separate ridges between gables, (6) do cornerboards appropriately. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 11/0  AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH, RISTAINO, WATKINS
Application: 1532 The Plaza – Addition.

Conceptual approval was granted in April 2007 with Design Review given the authority to grant final approval. A final drawing was to be submitted. This is that drawing but the time has long run out. This project is a sunroom on the right front corner of the house. Existing there now is a tile floor which will remain. Windows will glass in the space.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to APPROVE the application. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 11/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE
Design Review approved a sign for 901 East Boulevard. Mr. Ristaino, Mr. Dahnert, and Ms. Glennon voted unanimously to approve a sign that will be 10% smaller than last seen. Revised drawings will be submitted for approval documents.

A question has been asked of the Commission by the owner of 1821 Dilworth Road East. This is the house that has been lifted to create a basement and garage underneath. Final details are still to be approved and the owner has asked if he could come to a Design Review and have his final review in that setting. The Commission said they would all like to see the end product as a whole.

Ms. Owens announced that she has resigned from the Commission after the March meeting. Her husband has a consulting business and she will be travelling with him.

January Minutes were unanimously approved with the usual direction to report any changes or corrections to Mrs. Birmingham.

The meeting adjourned at 5:12 with a meeting length of two hours and four minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission