

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes

December 14, 2011

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Mr. Steven Firestone

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Ms. Paula Owens

Ms. Karen Rush

Mr. Curtis Watkins

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Ms. Debra Glennon, 2nd Vice Chair

Ms. Barbara Highfill

Two Vacancies

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator
 Historic District Commission

 Mrs. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the
 Historic District Commission

 Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present Ms. George called the regular December meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:10 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commission and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all

cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked than any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Mr. Roger reported that Mr. Egan had news to announce. His family welcomed a new baby girl last Monday. Her name is Claire.

Index of Addresses:	2012, 2016, 2020 Euclid Avenue	Dilworth
	225 North Graham Street	Fourth Ward
	1517 Wilmore Drive	Wilmore
	1924 Park Road	Dilworth
	816 East Worthington Avenue	Dilworth
	425 East Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
	1915 Park Road	Dilworth
	1615 Lela Avenue	Wesley Height

Application: 2012, 2016, 2020 Euclid Avenue – Demolition.

Conceptual Approval was granted for the redevelopment project in October. This property is located between McDonald Avenue and Tremont Avenue at the edge of the Dilworth Local Historic District. These three addresses are under a Stay of Demolition imposed by the HDC. The developers are asking for the Stay to be lifted while the final details are being worked out so they can begin to move forward developing the site. The project is a 22 unit development, with internal streets, individual street front entries, recessed garages, 4 end units actually “face” Euclid, taller units are behind the corner units, the previous tower corners have been deleted.

Applicant Comments: Wendy Fields pointed out that the four buildings now show stepping down the street. Each unit has a courtyard area. The final plans will be brought back to the HDC.

Richard Bartlett answered that there will be one parking space per unit and on-street parking. Materials to be seen later will most likely include Hardie shingles, clad windows, Hardie siding, and board and batten details. The Zoning is in place to build this project. Street improvement will require tree removal and all trees showing on the plans will be new.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on potential final approval of proposed project, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to LIFT the Stay effective December 15, 2011. Mr. Firestone seconded.

VOTE: 7/1 AYES: DAHNERT, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, OWENS, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: DUFFY

DECISION: STAY OF DEMOLITION LIFTED.

Application: 335 North Graham Street – Sign.

This Post Properties building occupies this entire block bounded by Graham Street, 7th Street, Hearn Street, and Smith Street. The ground floor tenant at the corner of Graham and 7th would like to hang a business identification sign from an elbow attached to the building. The sign would be 75" x 34" - a silver cabinet with cut out letters lit from behind and read from both Graham and 7th. It will hang 9' off the ground.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on exception warranted to ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Signage*** by the size and scale of the building, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the sign. Ms. Owens seconded.

VOTE: 7/1 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, OWENS,
RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: EGAN

DECISION: SIGN APPROVED AS SUBMITTED.

Application: 1517 Wilmore Drive – New Construction.

This is a vacant lot. Proposed is a 2 story house on a slab with paired columns atop stone pillars supporting a hipped porch roof. Wood siding will clad the first floor and shingles the second floor. A front facing gable detail will project the center bay of the front porch.

Applicant Comments: Owner/Builder Michael Iagnemma said the shakes will be cypress and cedar.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design development, Ms. Rush made a MOTION to set up a Design Review Committee to offer input to the builder. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, OWENS, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DESIGN REVIEW WILL MEET ON DECEMBER 21 AT 4:00 PM. MR. IAGNEMMA WILL MEET WITH MS. RUSH, MR. DUFFY, MS. GEORGE, AND STAFF.

Application: 1924 Park Road – Front Porch Restoration.

In the past the front porch had been remodeled to have three levels and the front steps were turned away from the street toward the driveway. The application is to reconfigure steps with wing walls to face forward and renovate the porch to be one level. A straight brick sidewalk will be installed from the new steps out to the City sidewalk. A step will be added at the end of the new sidewalk at the City sidewalk.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighbor John Phares, pointed out that the area from the sidewalk to steps to porch is an important area and any changes or additions must blend in with the context per HDC ***Policy & Design Guidelines***. Photographs he shared show an historic standard of concrete sidewalks. New rails have a chance to now be done right by matching what would be historically correct. Maintaining consistent fabric approval makes the HDC strong. Mr. Phares said there is a problem with the flagging of Historic District properties in Permitting in that they did not even show this address as in a Local Historic District.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines***, Mrs. Rush made a MOTION to APPROVE. Staff will review final details for approval. Mr. Watkins seconded.

VOTE: 7/0
RUSH, WATKINS

AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, OWENS,

NAYS: NONE

ABSTAIN: FIRESTONE (out of the room)

DECISION: PORCH CHANGES, SIDEWALK, AND STEPS APPROVED WITH STAFF TO SEE FINAL PLANS.

Mr. Duffy declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the next application.

Application: 816 East Worthington Avenue – Addition.

A two story addition is proposed to the rear by extending the existing gable. A side two story element is wider than the house. Phony shutters will be removed from existing house. Materials and details will match existing.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the plans with the addition of an upper window in the new addition facing the street. Proposed plans show details, windows, and materials matching the existing house and an addition that compliments and blends while differentiated. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 7/0

AYES: DAHNERT, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, OWENS, RUSH,

WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 425 East Tremont Avenue – Addition.

The plan is to enlarge the ½ story of this square brick house and add some style. A sweeping, shake clad, gable over a new front porch, supported by columns atop stone piers, will be added with a stone foundation. The roof plane will be extended to accommodate a side-to-side rear shed dormer that will tie below new roof ridge. A shed dormer will be added above front porch. The chimney will be raised.

Applicant Comments: The shutters and awnings will be removed.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood resident John Phares said the triangular vent showing on the plans in the new front facing gable is not traditional. The vent should be rectangular. The owner should be encouraged to expand the depth of the front porch to make it actually usable.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions*** Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the application with revised plans which show a simplification of material choices, sets of windows to match each other or one be a pair, column dimensions, enlarged front porch, no cultured stone, rectangular vent, simple chimney cap, siding in side gables. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE,
OWENS, RUSH, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: STAFF MAY APPROVE FINAL PLANS THAT SHOW ALL CHANGES.

Mr. Egan declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the next application.

Application: 1915 Park Road – Addition.

This is a shingle style house with an engaged front porch. The plan is to raise the roof plane behind the front gable. Side facing shed dormers will be added as well as a new chimney, two rear facing gables, and side facing gables on each side, a pergola on the rear between flanking gables.

FOR/AGAINST: Mr. Phares complimented the project as very nicely done.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 7/0
RUSH, WATKINS

AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, FIRESTONE, GEORGE, OWENS,

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 1615 Lela Avenue – Addition.

This application is for the addition of stone to a front terrace, sidewalk, and steps. It was recently deferred for more information and a review of the material choices.

MOTION: Based on the need for additional information and further design study, Mr. Curtis made a MOTION to DEFER this application. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 8/0
OWENS, RUSH, WATKINS

AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FIRESTONE, GEORGE,

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

The November Minutes were approved unanimously with the usual direction to report any changes or corrections to Mrs. Birmingham.

The meeting adjourned at 6:20 pm with a meeting length of 3 hours and 10 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission