



Approved October 12, 2011

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

August 10, 2011

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Ms. Colette Forrest

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Ms. Debra Glennon, 2nd Vice Chair

Ms. Barbara Highfill

Ms. Paula Owens

Ms. Karen Rush

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. Steven Firestone

Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

Mr. Curtis Watkins

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator
 Historic District Commission

 Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the
 Historic District Commission

 Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

Mr. Rogers introduced the newly appointed member representing the Wesley Heights neighborhood, Ms. Colette Forrest. She is a long time resident of the neighborhood.

With a quorum present Ms. George called the regular August meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:07 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of

the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

| | | |
|---------------------|--------------------------|----------------|
| Index of Addresses: | 1920 South Mint Street | Wilmore |
| | 508 East Kingston Avenue | Dilworth |
| | 2026 Thomas Avenue | Plaza Midwood |
| | 1621 Dilworth Road East | Dilworth |
| | 325 Rensselaer Avenue | Dilworth |
| | 1612 Wickford Place | Wilmore |
| | 724 Woodruff Place | Wesley Heights |

Application: 1920 South Mint Street – Addition.

This application for the addition of a second story was deferred in July with the offer of Design Review input for further design development. The past plans attempted to save the bungalow style but it seemed to heavy an addition for the little house. Revised plans show an honest four square creation with a full two story and front porch. The existing chimney will be extended.

Design Review Comments: Ms. Highfill said though the proposed is an appropriate style, it is painful to relinquish the original style.

Mr. Duffy said the scale issues have been met and the new plans look great. The new drive needs to be straightened and go past the front of the house on the right. The gable needs to be added to one of the elevations.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the plans with accurate plans to be submitted for Staff review and approval. Revised plans will show (1) the front gable, (2) the driveway straightened and going down the right side of the house, (3) sidewalk straight out – with an offshoot to the drive if wanted. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FORREST, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: FINAL PLANS WILL BE REVIEWED AND MAY BE APPROVED BY STAFF.

Application: 508 East Kingston Avenue – Rear Addition.

This two story house was moved from Park Road in the 1980s. The proposal is to remove a rear deck and add a rear addition with a standing seam copper roof. A patio will be beyond the new addition and an outdoor fireplace and chimney will be added to the patio. A stair is to the side of the house bringing the whole project to the full Commission.

Applicant Comments: Architect Allen Brooks said a simple wrought iron rail will be around the brick patio with a sitting area at a different level. The brick will match existing brick.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the application. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FORREST, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: REAR ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 2016 Thomas Avenue – Deck.

The proposal is to add a rear deck which wraps the house to meet a side door.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the deck. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FORREST, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DECK APPROVED.

Application: 1621 Dilworth Road East – Façade Renovation.

St. Patrick's Cathedral has a less than adequate main entry way on Dilworth Road East. The cathedral doors open onto a landing that is small with steps going off it in three directions. Several people have fallen. A second landing is bigger but not easy and convenient. New welcoming arms stairs will hit the City sidewalk straight on with a wall/art niche between them. A sign will be in the brick wall. This plan was approved by the HDC in 2002 but the approval has expired. All materials will match existing.

Applicant Comments: Architect John Phares said the first land with stairs all around is very dangerous.

FOR/AGAINST: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the renovations with Staff to see simple rail details. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, FORREST, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: FAÇADE RENOVATIONS APPROVED.

Application: 325 Rensselaer Avenue – Second Floor Addition.

This is a one story wood sided cross gable house which has a past rear addition in HardiePlank. The proposal is to extend the existing front roof plane up, add a shed dormer on the front, rear facing gable will tie below new ridge line, side facing shed dormers, and reside the entirety with HardiePlank.

FOR/AGAINST: Otis Carmen endorsed the use of Hardie products.

MOTION: Based on probable compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition IN CONCEPT. Further design study and corrected/revised plans will show: (1) symmetry and

scale of façade, (2) wood siding, (3) brackets, (4) consistent trim, (5) soffit boxing resolved, (6) rear elevation – offset sides by at least one foot, (7) dormer slope flatness corrected. Ms. Highfill seconded.

VOTE: 7/2 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL,
OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: EGAN, FORREST

DECISION: PLANS APPROVED IN CONCEPT WITH REVISED PLANS TO COME BACK TO THE HDC.

Application: 1612 Wickford Place – Replace Siding.

This house was purchased with replacement windows, trim ripped out, and some vinyl siding, mostly missing siding. Wood siding still remains on the front. The request is to use HardiePlank on three sides – not the front. All trim would be rebuilt where it is missing.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on no exception warranted to ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Substitute Siding***, Ms. Highfill made a MOTION to DENY the use of substitute siding. Ms. Owens seconded.

VOTE: 7/2 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL,
OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: EGAN, FORREST

DECISION: SUBSTITUTE SIDING DENIED (HARDIEPLANK).

Ms. Forrest left at 5:22 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

Application: 725 Woodruff Place – Second Story Addition.

This one story house site on the uphill/City view side of Woodruff Place. This proposal calls for a new front porch with a standing seam metal shed roof. The existing ridge will be extended to create a ½ second story. A front dormer will be added in new roof plane. A new back porch will have a shed roof. All materials will match existing. Windows will be replaced within policy.

Applicant Comments: Architect Nancy Montague said the intent is to clean up the architecture and add a 2nd floor.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Duffy made a MOTION to APPROVE as submitted with revised plans to include missing pieces to be submitted to Staff for final approval to be issued. Mr. Dahnert seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED BUT FINAL PLANS WILL BE SUBMITTED TO STAFF.

July Minutes were approved unanimously with the usual direction to report any changes or corrections to Mrs. Birmingham. One correction was mentioned – a mistake in the spelling of Ms. Owens' name.

The meeting adjourned at 6:18 with a length of three hours and 11 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission