



Approved July 13, 2011

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

MINUTES

June 8, 2011

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Ms. Debra Glennon, 2nd Vice Chair

Ms. Paula Owens

Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

Mr. Curtis Watkins

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Ms. Meg Nealon

Ms. Barbara Highfill

Ms. Karen Rush

One Vacancy

OTHERS PRESENT:

Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the
Historic District Commission

Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

Ms. Terrie Hagler Gray, Senior Assistant City
Attorney

With a quorum present Ms. George called the regular June meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:07 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to

silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Mr. Rogers reported that Mr. Grueneich has resigned from the Commission. His work is requiring that he be out of town some Wednesdays. Staff is working on finding someone to apply for this Wesley Heights vacancy.

Ms. Nealon is also going off the Commission as she has been appointed to the Development Review Board and cannot sit on the HDC and this new board and be a member of the Planning Commission.

Index of Addresses:	816 Mt. Vernon Avenue	Dilworth
	401 West Park Avenue	Wilmore
	600 Mt. Vernon Avenue	Dilworth
	2019 Park Road	Dilworth
	1809 Thomas Avenue	Dilworth
	1009 Mt. Vernon Avenue	Dilworth
	2108 Charlotte Drive	Dilworth

Application: 816 Mt. Vernon Avenue – Change in previously approved plan.

A screened porch at the back corner of the house that extends into the side yard was recently approved for this Dilworth house. The requested change involves the fireplace on the proposed porch. Rather than a ventless brick fireplace that faces the street the revised plan shows a brick chimney at the end

of the porch addition to serve a wood burning fireplace. Skylights have been added into the new hipped roof.

Applicant Comments: Designer Angie Lauer said the changes are (1) relocate the fireplace, (2) change the roof shape to a hip, (3) addition of skylights, (4) brick chimney. There is a property line fence that is 6' tall.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE the new fireplace location and chimney, the skylights, the roof form. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: CHANGES APPROVED.

Application: 401 West Park Avenue – Demolition and New Construction.

This house is at the corner of Wickford Place and West Park Avenue in the Wilmore neighborhood. Tremendous water damage has driven the insurance company to say it is unsalvageable and must be torn down. The Commission recently questioned the insurance company's opinion and asked for an engineer's report regarding the viability of the remaining structure and whether or not it could be salvaged. That report has been submitted and it seems the gutted interior has now been dried out and worthy of renovation.

Applicant Comments: Owner Charles Mackay said the report verifies that the remaining structure is structurally sound. So his family is now back to the drawing board to renovate.

MOTION: Mr. Dahnert said A Resolution will be written up by Mr. Rogers for Mr. Mackay's use. It will state what has transpired: (1) HDC found the structure to be a Contributing structure to the Wilmore Local Historic District, (2) a year Delay of Demolition has been imposed which will create a window to investigate alternatives to demolition, (3) the house is in good structural condition per engineer's report, (4) it is better to renovate than tear down. NOTE: The interior can be renovated without HDC approval. Upon approval of any exterior work the remainder of the Stay will be lifted but remains in place for now. Mr. Duffy seconded.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak FOR or AGAINST the application.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: RESOLUTION CREATED FOR MR. MACKAY'S USE.

Application: 600 Mt. Vernon Avenue – Addition.

This c. 1947 one story stucco house with a cross gable roof is located on a rise at the intersection of Mr. Vernon Avenue and Euclid Avenue. There is a small connected garage facing Euclid. The proposal is to create a new rear facing gable that ties beneath the existing cross ridge. Windows will be replaced and stucco will be patched and match where necessary.

Applicant Comments: Architect Ray Sheedy said the addition will not change the architectural language of the house. He explained the addition – the existing U-shape of the house created an interior courtyard that will become the new kitchen, the back of the garage will become a screened porch and glassed porch.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED.

Application: 2019 Park Road – Addition.

This story and ½ house is located at the corner of Park Road. Two dormers will be added – one gabled dormer facing to the side beyond existing gabled dormer, and one hipped dormer facing the rear. A screened in side porch is to be enclosed with glass.

Applicant Comments: Designer Angie Lauer said previous owners had some elements approved in the major 2003 renovation that were never executed. The glassed in side porch had been approved in the past with full view windows and the change is that now the windows will have muntin patterns. This will be a Preservation Tax Credit Project. The past renovation won a Preservation award for the Best Tax Credit Project.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE revised plans which show a gable form dormer on the rear. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 7/1
RISTAINO

AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS,

NAYS: WATKINS

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED WITH REVISED PLANS TO SHOW REQUIRED CHANGE.

Application: 1809 Thomas Avenue – Tree Removal.

A multi trunk gumball tree grows in the front yard of this house. The plan is to remove the gumball trees to free up the space to plant something less of a nuisance. The owner proposes to plant two replacement trees in the front yard – a flowering ornamental and a red maple.

Applicant Comments: Owner Dan Hartenstein said they would like to plant something more intentional than the sweet gum volunteers.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Tree Removal***, Mr. Watkins made a MOTION to APPROVE the removal of the sweet gum trees. Mr. Rogers will follow up with City Arborist, Don McSween, about the missing street tree in the tree lawn in front of this house. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: GUMBALL TREE REMOVAL APPROVED.

Application: 1009 Mt. Vernon Avenue – Tree Removal.

This address was once a four unit apartment building but is now a three unit condominium. A river birch tree grows at one of the front corners of the building too close for comfort of the owner. The proposal is to remove the river birch tree.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Tree Removal***, Ms. Glennon made a MOTION to APPROVE the tree removal with the suggestion

that a large maturing canopy tree be planted somewhere on the property. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, OWENS, RISTAINO, WATKINS

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: RIVER BIRCH TREE MAY BE REMOVED. REPLACEMENT SUGGESTED.

Mr. Dahnert removed himself from the Commission to become the applicant for the next application.

Application: 2108 Charlotte Drive – Add Mechanical Unit.

This house has a cross gable roof. A through-the-wall mechanical unit is proposed beside a double hung window in the attic.

Following a discussion, owner Roger Dahnert withdrew his application.

- Staff has a question for the Commission regarding replacement windows for 1821 Dilworth Road East. Usually, window replacement is something Staff can make work but this house is in the midst of a major renovation

that the Commission will review in final form. It was decided that windows could be replaced with no changes but if any changes are proposed then this would be added to the final plans for HDC to review.

- Changes to the rules and procedures were approved with one change noted – “letter to applicants”. Mr. Duffy made the MOTION and Mr. Curtis seconded and vote was unanimous.
- Mr. Dahnert reported that the Nominating Committee met and recommend that the officers remain as they have been the past year: Ms. George - Chair, Mr. Ristaino – Vice Chair, Ms. Glennon – 2nd Vice Chair. The nominations were accepted by acclimation.
- Minutes (April 13, 2011 and May 11, 2011) were unanimously approved with the direction that any changes or corrections be called in to Ms. Birmingham.

With business completed the meeting adjourned at 6:20 pm with a meeting length of 3 hours and 13 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission

