



Approved June 8, 2011

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Minutes

May 11, 2011

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Roger Dahnert

Mr. Don Duffy

Mr. Tom Egan

Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair

Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair

Ms. Barbara Highfill

Ms. Meg Nealon

Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

Ms. Karen Rush

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. Greg Grueneich

Ms. Paula Owens

Mr. Curtis Watkins

OTHERS PRESENT:

Mr. John Rogers Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the

Historic District Commission

Mr. Thomas Powers, Assistant City Attorney

With a quorum present Ms. George called the regular May meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:15 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, Staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and Staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, OR DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Index of Addresses:      1612 Thomas Avenue      Plaza Midwood

1600 Wilmore Drive	Wilmore
530 Hermitage Court	Hermitage Court
601 North Graham Street	Fourth Ward
401 West Park Avenue	Wilmore
1236 East Boulevard	Dilworth

Application: 1612 Thomas Avenue – Enclose side porch.

An application to enclose the existing side porch at Thomas and Kensington Avenues in the Plaza Midwood neighborhood was recently deferred for additional design information. Revised plans show glass panels above the existing rail and breadboard panels below the rail. All detail will remain as it is.

Applicant Comments: Owner Greg Mark said on the front elevation, siding below the rail will match that on the house. He explained that fixed glass panels and casement windows will infill the current screened areas.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on possible compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Porch Enclosures***, Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to APPROVE IN CONCEPT the enclosure of this side porch. Staff may grant final approval to revised plans which show the window choice and exactly how the addition interfaces with the columns. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 8/0/1 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NEALON, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

ABSTAIN: RISTAINO

DECISION: SIDE PORCH APPROVED IN CONCEPT. STAFF WILL SEE REVISED PLANS AND MAY APPROVE.

---

Application: 1600 Wilmore Drive – New Construction.

New Construction was approved in concept for this unusual, non conforming lot at the corner of Wilmore Drive and West Park Avenue in the Wilmore neighborhood. The plans for the new house were missing notes and details. Revised plans are noted up with one change pointed out – the shed dormer ties below the ridge.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Mr. Dahnert made a MOTION to send this application to a Design Review Committee. The Committee will work with the applicants on getting final details worked out. The Committee will have the power to grant Final Approval. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DESIGN REVIEW HAS THE POWER TO APPROVE.

---

Ms. Highfill declared a conflict of interest as an Adjacent Property Owner and removed herself from the Commission for the next application.

---

Application: 530 Hermitage Court – Addition.

A similar application was recently deferred for a terrace across the front of the house and paving in the front yard. Revised plans show a terrace across the front of the house with a low seating wall around the edge. Existing bays will be become engaged in the new terrace. The additional paving has been dropped from the proposal. An entry element will be added over the front door.

Applicant Comments: Architect Greg Perry explained the hooded gable over the front door supported by brackets. A straight sidewalk will be added in brick.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for final details, Ms. Nealon made a MOTION to APPROVE the front terrace, hooded entry, and brick walk based on ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions, Landscape Features***, with Staff to have the ability to grant the Final Approval documents on revised plans. Mr. Egan seconded.

VOTE: 8/0 AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: FINAL PLANS WILL BE SUBMITTED FOR STAFF TO APPROVE.

---

Application: 601 North Graham Street – Signage and Greenhouse.

This is a learning facility that is nestled into the center of the property which covers a City block in the Fourth Ward neighborhood. It is bounded by Graham, 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup>, and Smith Streets. There is a covered drive through entrance where a sign is proposed facing Graham Street. Individual letters will spell out ‘Lifespan’ on the cornice of the porte cochere – 12” high in a length of 80”. An

additional sign will be installed nearer Graham Street. A 20' x 28' Quonset hut shaped greenhouse will be added in a lawn area near the back of the building. The greenhouse will have metal support poles and a plastic cover.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the size of the building and the scale of the campus, Mr. Egan made a motion to APPROVE the two signs as a justified exception to the ***Policy & Design Guidelines - Signage***. Staff will see the final renditions with the dandelion incorporated in both logos which acknowledges the branding detail and similar proportions. Ms. Nealon seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON HIGHFILL, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

MOTION: Based on warranted exception too ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to APPROVE the greenhouse. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: DAHNERT, DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIFHGILL, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: TWO SIGNS APPROVED ONCE DETAILS ARE DETERMINED. GREEN HOUSE APPROVED.

---

Application:            401 West Park Avenue – Demolition and New Construction.

This c. 1933 house is located at the corner of West Park Avenue and Wickford Place in the Wilmore neighborhood. It is a 1 and ½ story, front to back gable with cross gable in the center. The applicant is acting on behalf of his family as the executor of their mother's estate. While the house was vacant and closed up, a pipe broke allowing water to flow unknown for a long period of time. The insurance agent said the house is unsalvageable and the house has been gutted. Due to the insurance involvement there is a time limit within which the house must be demolished and the new one built for the claim to remain valid. This request is for the HDC to approve the demolition and review the new construction plans at the same meeting.

Applicant Comments: Charles Mackay said his mother passed away and he is working with insurance on behalf of his family. It is now said that mold and fungus and rot from the attic to the basement due to the water flowing has made the house uninhabitable and little remains of the interior. Huge blowers ran for weeks but the moisture content in the framing remains at an unacceptably high level. Insurance will not cover remediation but will cover a new house.

---

Mr. Dahnert left at 5:30 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

---

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the age of the house and the remaining exterior, Ms. Nealon made a MOTION to recognize the house as Contributing to the Wilmore Local Historic District. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 8/0           AYES: DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON HIGHFILL, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: HOUSE DETERMINED TO BE CONTRIBUTING.

FOR/AGAINST:     No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION:     Based on the need for an inspection report, an engineer's report, and plans for new construction, M. Nealon made a MOTION to impose the maximum 365 Day Stay of Demolition. The time frame may be shortened at any time that the missing information is submitted for full Commission review. Mr. Duffy seconded.

VOTE: 8/0           AYES: DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NEALON, RISTAINO, RUSH

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: DEMOLITION DEFERRED.

MOTION:     Based on the extenuating circumstances, Mr. Egan made a MOTION to waive the 90 day time policy before reviewing new construction plans after a demolition request has been presented. Ms. Rush seconded.

NOTE: Suggestions on what the Commission would like to see were given regarding new construction which includes:

- .masonry fireplace
- .casing that is to the degree of the existing
- .trim that is historically appropriate
- .an adequately deep porch
- .same quality and details as existing



.adequate fenestration

.wood for wood.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for further design study, Ms. Nealon made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Glennon seconded.

VOTE: 7/1            AYES: DUFFY, EGAN, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, NEALON, RISTAINO

NAYS: RUSH

DECISION: NEW CONTRUCTION PLANS DEFERRED.

---

Mr. Egan left at 6:35 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

---

Application: 1236 East Boulevard – Paint Brick.

This building is near the very edge of the Dilworth Local Historic District. It has been used as business for years. It has a substantial brick foundation and brick piers on the front. The owner would like to paint all the brick.

FOR/AGAINST: No one was present in the audience to accept Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

---

Ms. Rush left at 6:45 pm and was not present for the remainder of the meeting.

---

With a quorum lost, Mr. Rogers said that he will call the applicant and go out and meet with him.

- Bill # 731 is in the State Legislature and may have an impact on Historic Districts.
- A Nominating Committee was appointed – Mr. Egan, Mr. Dahnert, and Ms. Rush. Officer nominations will be put forth to the Commission at the June meeting.
- Ms. Nealon has been appointed to a Design Review board for the City and June will be her last HDC meeting.

With business completed the meeting adjourned at 7:10 pm with a meeting length of three hours and fifty five minutes.

---

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission