



Approved August 11, 2010

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

July 14, 2010

MINUTES

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Roger Dahnert
Mr. Don Duffy
Mr. Tom Egan
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Chair
Ms. Debra Glennon, Second Vice Chair
Mr. Greg Grueneich
Ms. Barbara Highfill
Ms. Paula Owens
Mr. Dominick Ristaino, Vice Chair

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ms. Karen Rush
Two Vacancies (Planning Commission, Wilmore)

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator

Historic District Commission

Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary

Historic District Commission

Mr. Mujeeb Shah Khan, Assistant City Attorney

Ms. Lucia Griffith, Past HDC Member

Mr. Curtis Watkins, Wilmore Resident

With a quorum present, Chairman George called the regular July meeting of the HDC to order at 3:05 pm. She began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak, are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Ms. George asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission to please state name and address for the record. Ms. George explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next, members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again, there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to the Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Ms. George asked that all cell

phones and any other electronic devices be turned off completely or set to silent operation. She also asked that any Commissioner announce, for the record, their arrival and/or departure when this takes place during a meeting.

Mr. Rogers took the opportunity to introduce newly appointed HDC members.

Mr. Don Duffy is an architect who has been before the HDC with many projects. He has had a relationship with the HDC for many years and has finally found the time to join the Commission. City Council appointed Mr. Duffy to fill an At Large seat. He lives in Plaza Midwood.

Mr. Roger Dahnert is an architect who has been on the Commission in the past. It has been maybe 10 years since Mr. Dahnert served before. He has been appointed by City Council to fill the Dilworth Resident seat.

Mr. Tom Egan has an education in architect and is a consultant who has been appointed by City Council. He fills the Plaza Midwood seat.

Mr. Rogers also introduced Mr. Curtis Watkins who is a resident of the Wilmore Neighborhood. The Wilmore Neighborhood Association has recommended Mr. Watkins to Mayor Foxx as their choice to fill the new seat.

Mr. Rogers reported that Ms. Griffith did not accept reappointment as the Planning Commission representative on the HDC. A new person coming onto the Planning Commission may be the new Planning Commission choice to forward to the Mayor for appointment to the HDC. Her name is Meg Nealon and she is a landscape architect who has been on the Commission in the past.

Mr. Dahnert declared a conflict of interest and removed himself from the Commission for the first application.

Application: 2101 Dilworth Road East Dilworth

This c. 1929 Contributing house is at the corner of Dilworth Road East and Carling Avenue. Many years ago a side porch on the first floor of this two story brick house was enclosed. It is failing and the proposal is to rebuild it, reusing doors and windows and adding casement windows with transoms on the elevation facing the side street. An upstairs bathroom addition will be over the rebuilt Florida room.

Applicant Comments: Architect Michael O'Brien explained that the siding material of choice is either smooth finished MDO or Hardie Siding.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Ms. George's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Due to the need for further design study regarding materials, Tudorization, window/transom relationship, fence relationship to addition, Mr. Ristaino made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Ms. Highfill seconded.

VOTE: 7/1 AYES: DUFFY, EGAN, GLENNON, GRUENEICH, HIGHFILL, OWENS, RISTAINO

NAYS: GEORGE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED FOR FURTHER DESIGN STUDY.

Ms. Owens invited the Commission to come to the McNinch house in Fourth Ward for a social. The restaurant is closed on Monday so several dates were suggested. August 30th was chosen as the date most could

attend. Mr. Shah Khan reminded Commission members that a social is fine but that the Commission could not discuss business.

Mr. Shah Khan continued this subject saying there is much scrutiny of public bodies. Commissioners are not to communicate with each other. The Open Meetings Law applies to electronic communications. Everything is public record including emails to staff and each other.

In response to a question from Ms. Glennon, Mr. Rogers reported that the house at the corner of East Park Avenue and Dilworth Road West is under construction with no garage – neither free standing nor underneath.

Ms. Griffith took the opportunity to say that she has had the pleasure of serving on the Commission for three years and has learned much. Hopefully a new member on the Planning Commission will be appointed to the HDC.

Minutes were approved and the direction was given that for any corrections or changes, to notify Ms. Birmingham.

The meeting adjourned at 4:15 with a meeting length of one hour and ten minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission