HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

May 13, 2009

MINUTES

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mr. Jonathan Crotty, Chair
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Alt. Vice Chair
Ms. Debra Glennon
Ms. Barbara Highfill
Mr. Jeff Koenig
Mr. John Phares
Mr. Damon Rumsch
Ms. Karen Rush
Mr. Terry Sheffield

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ms. Lucia Griffith
One Vacancy

OTHERS PRESENT: Mr. John Rogers, Administrator
               Historic District Commission
Mr. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the
Historic District Commission

Mr. Mujeeb Shah-Khan, Assistant City Attorney

Ms. Tamara Titus, Liaison between DCDA and HDC

Sign In Sheet

With a quorum present, Chairman Crotty called the regular May meeting to order at 3:05 pm. He began the meeting with a welcome to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Mr. Crotty asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission please state name and address for the record. Mr. Crotty explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next, members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again, there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant. The second part is the discussion and deliberation portion of the meeting. At this point, discussion of the application is limited to Commission members and staff only. Unless the Commission votes to re-open the meeting to ask additional questions or for clarification of some issue, the applicant and audience members do not participate in this portion of the discussion. Once discussion is complete, a MOTION will be made to APPROVE, DENY, or DEFER and a vote will be taken. A simple majority vote of those Commissioners present is required for a decision. Mr. Crotty asked that all cell phones and any other electronic devices be either turned completely off or set to silent operation. He also asked that all
Commissioners announce, for the record, their arrival and departure when this takes place during the meeting.

Mr. Rogers introduced the newest Mayoral appointee to the Commission. She is Landscape Architect and Dilworth resident, Debra Glennon. In preparing for the potential appointment, Ms. Glennon has attended the last several HDC meetings.

Index of Addresses: 1039 Arosa Avenue Dilworth

1721 Lyndhurst Avenue Dilworth

Application: 1039 Arosa Avenue – Roofing.

The Commission approved the additions and reworking the entry last month. The choice for roofing was deferred. There was to be repaired slate, reused slate, and artificial slate. It was deferred to explore a better alternative material. A sample board was prepared by Commissioner Rumsch.

Applicant Comments: Builder Rick Norvell, said following research, it has been determined that they did not want to use an unproved product. A matching substitute will be used on the roof elevations facing to the rear and repaired or reused slate will be used on front facing slopes. All will match each other.

FOR/AGAINST: Audience member Cathy Spence said the alternate roofing is a very green way to go.
MOTION: Based on exception warranted to *Policy & Design Guidelines – Replacement Roofing*, Ms. Rush made a MOTION to approve substitute slate roofing (Inspire or Echo Star) on rear facing roof slopes. Material breaks from natural slate to artificial slate will be accomplished in a valley or at a ridge but not mixed in plane. Roof ridges will all match both in material and profile. Mr. Koenig seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CROTTY, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RUMSCH, RUSH, SHEFFIELD

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ARTIFICIAL SLATE ROOFING APPROVED ON REAR ELEVATIONS.

Application: 1721 Lyndhurst Avenue – Addition.

This is one of the new houses now completed side-by-side on Lyndhurst Avenue. A roof/awning will be added over the triple gang of windows. Wooden supporting bracket will match those found on the side of the house and garage. Standing seam copper will be the choice for roofing material. This is an effort to break the top-to-bottom mass of the elevation.

FOR/AGAINST: No accepted Mr. Crotty’s invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.
MOTION: Based on the need for more detailed drawings, Mr. Sheffield made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Mr. Rumsch seconded.

VOTE: 9/0 AYES: CROTTY, GEORGE, GLENNON, HIGHFILL, KOENIG, PHARES, RUMSCH, RUSH, SHEFFIELD

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: AWNING STRUCTURE OVER WINDOWS DEFERRED FOR MORE INFORMATION.

Cathy Spence reported that the National Green Council is coming to Charlotte on June 22 and 23 and wants to meet with an HDC member. Mr. Rumsch volunteered to meet with the Council. Mr. Rogers said that Stuart Gray of the Historic Landmarks Commission is inviting the Historic District Commission to a workshop on June 10th regarding 20th Century Housing Stock. Mr. Rogers reported that in an Urban Design meeting he found out that the Dilworth Inn project is in negotiation to save/reuse both houses on the property. The older one would be moved 3 blocks away and the newer one would be turned around to face the side street and slide into what is now a rear parking lot. A Certificate of Appropriateness for DEMOLITION is eligible for issue in 3 months.
Regarding 2037 The Plaza – the existence of the storage building was deferred. A time frame of 6 months to correct is given in the Ordinance. Most options would be Staff Approvable.

The discussion on Non-Traditional Building Materials continued from May. Issues to consider include: (1) New Construction vs. existing, (2) Multi-family vs. single family, (3) green, (4) differentiation – old from new, (5) Materials and form, (6) Quality of materials, (7) Contributing vs. Non-Contributing structures.

Mr. Crotty suggested starting a list of material standards that an applicant would receive up front. Mr. Rogers will work with Mr. Sheffield and Mr. Rumsch for something to come to the June meeting. Ms. George said this will help alleviate the problem of someone applying for one thing and something else getting done.

With no changes reported, the May Minutes were APPROVED by acclimation.

With business complete, the May meeting adjourned at 5:04 pm with a meeting length of 1 hour and 59 minutes.

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission.