



Approved April 15, 2009

## HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

### MINUTES

March 11, 2009

#### MEMBERS PRESENT:

Mr. Jonathan Crotty, Chair  
Ms. Mary Ellen George, Alt. Vice Chair  
Ms. Barbara Highfill  
Mr. Jeff Koenig  
Ms. Jane Anne McDermott  
Mr. John Phares  
Mr. Damon Rumsch  
Ms. Karen Rush  
Mr. Terry Sheffield, Vice Chair

#### MEMBERS ABSENT:

One Vacancy  
Ms. Lucia Griffith

#### OTHERS PRESENT:

Mr. John Rogers, Administrator  
Historic District Commission  
Ms. Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the  
Historic District Commission  
Mr. Mujeeb Shah Khan, Assistant  
City Attorney  
Ms. Tamara Titus, Liaison between HDC and DCDA

With a quorum present, Chairman Crotty called the regular March meeting of the Historic District Commission to order at 3:07 pm. He began with a welcome

to all in attendance and by swearing in those present (and continued to do so throughout the meeting as others arrived). Due to the quasi-judicial nature of the Commission, staff and others who may speak, are sworn in at every meeting. (Commissioners are sworn in by the City Clerk for the length of the appointment at the beginning of each term.) Mr. Crotty asked that everyone in attendance please sign in and when addressing the Commission please state name and address for the record. Mr. Crotty explained the meeting process. The review of each application consists of two parts. The first is the presentation portion. Staff presents the application then Commissioners and those speaking on behalf of the application will discuss the project. Next, members of the audience will be asked if anyone present wishes to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application. Again, there will be an opportunity for comments and questions from the Commission and the applicant.

Index of Addresses:	404 E. Tremont Avenue	Dilworth
	1039 Arosa Avenue	Dilworth
	1319 Thomas Avenue	Plaza Midwood

Application: 404 East Tremont Avenue – New Construction.

The imposed 365 Day Stay of Demolition runs out this month. New construction plans were deferred in February following a discussion regarding hierarchy and context. Past plans showed a large front facing gable, sweeping side gables, extended ridge height of cross gable, and a large rear shed dormer. Revised plans now show: (1) shortened footprint depth, (2) a secondary side gable, (3) a change of the pattern in the shakes, (4) the roof ridge lowered, (5) lowered shed roof with smaller windows, (6) side elevations very similar to each other, (7) shallower pitch of new front facing gable.

Applicant Comments: Architect John Fryday, said everything is lower with clipped ceilings upstairs. A change of materials and material application breaks down the scale. All materials are real wood.

FOR/AGAINST: Neighborhood Resident, Tamara Titus, complimented the architect on incorporating past comments. She questioned height notes and a discrepancy on the plans.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – New Construction***, Ms. George made a MOTION to APPROVE the New Construction with staff to see revised and corrected plans which show side gable vents (front an option also), appropriate trim, and rain chains. Ms. Rush seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: CROTTY, GEORGE, HEIGHFILL, KOENIG,  
MCDERMOTT, PHARES, RUMSCH, RUSH, SHEFFIELD

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: NEW CONSTRUCTION APPROVED WITH REVISED PLANS  
REVIEWED BY STAFF.

---

Application:            1039 Arosa Avenue – Addition.

This address is across from the parking lot of Covenant Presbyterian and beside the Randolph Scott House. An offset rear addition is proposed. An existing side porch will be extended to create an entry. A small upper addition will be located behind existing ridge. This renovation/addition will be a Preservation Tax Credit project. All details and materials will match existing house.

Applicant Comments:    Architect Allen Brooks introduced owner Daphne Norvell and contractor Rick Norvell. He said the right side of the house has an incredible view of downtown with the spire of Covenant in the foreground. The right side addition is a floor-plan-driven scheme which does not change the historic parts of the house – original portion remains intact. By wrapping the addition to the right, a balance with the glassed-in porch to the left is created. All existing windows are replacement and all siding is covered in aluminum. A portico was removed and replaced with a stoop. Everything will be restored. The natural slate roof will be matched in kind or with rubber slate which would match. SHPO comments are yet to come in.

Owner, Daphne Norvell said they are trying to keep the original feel and evolution of the house by talking to family members/previous owners.

Rick Norvell said that Amerislate makes a perfect match.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Mr. Crotty's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on compliance with ***Policy & Design Guidelines – Additions***, Mr. Rumsch made a MOTION to APPROVE the addition IN CONCEPT with final drawings to be submitted which show any Preservation Tax Credit changes and a slate sample. Mr. Sheffield seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: CROTTY, GEORGE, HIGHFILL, KOENIG,  
MCDERMOTT, PHARES, RUMSCH, RUSH, SHEFFIELD

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: ADDITION APPROVED IN CONCEPT.

---

Application:            1319 Thomas Avenue – Change to Previously  
Approved Plan.

This early Victorian cottage is the first structure in the Historic District on Thomas Avenue. A renovation/addition was approved. Changes to the approved plans happened in the field, one-by-one for different reasons. The slope of the front porch had to be changed due to a Code requirement. A long-ago fire called for changes to the roof structure. The warranty of the new roof called for more than two courses of siding as previously drawn. Required egress required a different size of upper windows. Head room in the newly created upstairs needed more height. Mr. Rumsch complimented Mr. and Mrs. Smith for saving this important house and volunteered to offer suggestions on what documents and information to prepare for the Commission at the price of recusing himself from the next discussion.

Applicant Comments: Owners Baxter and Janet Smith said they had so many masters to answer to that they were just making the changes that different officials were requiring.

FOR/AGAINST: No one accepted Mr. Crotty's invitation to speak either FOR or AGAINST the application.

MOTION: Based on the need for additional information and as-built drawings, Ms. McDermott made a MOTION to DEFER the application. Mr. Koenig seconded.

VOTE: 9/0            AYES: CROTTY, GEORGE, HIGHFILL, KOENIG,  
MCDERMOTT, PHARES, RUMSCH, RUSH, SHEFFIELD

NAYS: NONE

DECISION: APPLICATION DEFERRED.

---

Consulting Director of the Historic Landmarks Commission, Dr. Dan Morrill, reported on the recent HLC purchase of 1708 Park Road. This is only the second time that the Revolving Fund has been used to purchase a Contributing structure within a Local Historic District. In the past the fund has been used to purchase only Landmarks but can be used to buy any Contributing property within a Local Historic District. 1708 Park Road was a good choice for the HLC to purchase. This 1923 house is a pristine example of the expertise of bungalow architect, Fred Bonfoy. There remains an amazing degree of interior integrity. Very near East Boulevard, this short Park Road block would be forever protected from a 'land deal' being assembled and redeveloped. Protective covenants to prevent demolition will be built into the deed before resale. Deed covenants are permanent. Not an Imminent Domain issue, this has been a negotiated purchase. Dr. Morrill thanked the Commission for their continued preservation work.

Mr. Rogers gave a presentation on the relationship between Zoning and Development in Historic Districts.

A MOTION was made, seconded, and voted unanimously to APPROVE the February minutes as distributed.

Mr. Crotty reported that the Dilworth neighborhood is talking about speed bumps. It appears that hospital employees are racing through the neighborhood. Stop signs would prevent street parking but speed humps would not.

The meeting adjourned at 6:04 with a meeting length of 3 hours and 3 minutes.

---

Wanda Birmingham, Secretary to the Historic District Commission